within the shared intellectual domain variously described in this volume understand it to be separable into Tamil and Sanskrit knowledge fields? However we are to understand this shared domain, what choices led to its precipitation into languages that keep considerations of the other beyond the bounds of conversation? The scope of silence that authors maintained about their ability to traverse linguistic domains remains an extraordinary fact and an ideological commitment. Why did they choose to write in one language or the other, and what guided their strategies of interlinguistic appropriation? This volume shows the way forward. Rather than discussing Sanskrit and Tamil texts as uniform wholes interacting with one another, here discourse *within* texts is analyzed with care and precision, and broader cultural and historical arguments are grounded solidly in these analyses. Onward, let us hope, into studies that pursue the other southern languages! When volumes of this caliber pursue the focus on Sanskrit, Māhārāṣṭrī Prakrit, and Tamil in the company of Kannada, Telugu, Sinhala . . . the rewards will be immense.

BLAKE WENTWORTH
PORTOLA VALLEY, CALIF.

The Niśvāsatattvasaṃhitā: The Earliest Surviving Śaiva Tantra, vol. 1: *A Critical and Annotated Translation of the Mūlasūtra, Uttarasūtra and Nayasūtra*. Edited by DOMINIC GOODALL in collaboration with ALEXIS SANDERSON and HARUNAGA ISAACSON with contributions of NIRAJAN KAFLR, DIWAKAR ACHARYA, and others. Collection Indologie, no. 128, Early Tantra Series, no. 1. Pondichéry: INSTITUT FRANÇAIS DE PONDICHÉRY, Paris: ÉCOLE FRANÇAISE D'EXTRÊME-ORIENT, Hamburg: ASIEN-AFRIKA-INSTITUT, UNIVERSITÄT HAMBURG, 2015. Pp. 662. Rs. 1200, €52.

This is a very important publication in the Early Tantra Series from the French Institute of Pondicherry, the École français d'Extrême Orient, and the University of Hamburg. The overall aim of the series is to publish critical editions, studies, and translations of texts preserved by the Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project and from the collection of the Śaiva manuscripts of Pondicherry. The publication of the *Niśvāsatattvasaṃhitā* is singularly important because it is the earliest surviving Śaiva Tantra and the "corner-stone" of the Early Tantra project, the earliest witness being a ninth-century manuscript found in the Nepalese collection. Although the main editor Dominic Goodall carried out the bulk of the work, reading the editors' acknowledgements we see that this is very much a product of a collaborative effort sustained over a number of years.

A preface establishes the importance of the *Niśvāsa* for the history of Tantrism, showing its relation to earlier traditions. If we restrict the term "tantric Śaivism" to the Mantramārga (the Path of Mantras) as distinct from the earlier religions from which it arose, the Atimārga (the Higher or Outer Path) comprising the renunciate orders of the Pāśupatas, then the *Niśvāsa* marks a continuity between the two systems. Building on the work of Alexis Sanderson about the Atimārga, the editors show a doctrinal continuity especially in cosmography that is used in the context of initiation. In contrast to the Atimārga, the Mantramārga emphasised the two goals of liberation (*mukti*) and enjoyment of supernatural powers (*bhukti*), both attained by the use of spells (*mantra*, *vidyā*) in complex ritual and both requiring initiation (*dīkṣā*). Mantras for magical rituals and initiation are not new, being shared by the Atimārga and even by Vedic sacrifice, but what marks out the Mantramārga as distinctive is the way in which these elements are combined and the introduction of new practices. The mantras used in the *Niśvāsa* are not Vedic, with the possible exception of the five *brahmamantra*s, and initiation has become a transformative rite necessary for liberation, not merely allowing access to the tradition and its texts, but cutting the bonds of the soul by Śiva's grace who acts through the initiating master, severing the soul's bondage to the cosmos with mantras. This combination of soteriological and magical mantras, and the liberating force of initiation, ensured the appeal of the Mantramārga to a broad range of social groups and ensured its great success. The *Niśvāsa* marks the emergence of this new religion and influenced Buddhist sources as well. Indeed there is a non-soteriological common ground

between the *Niśvāsa* and magical rites of Buddhist Kriyātantras, particularly the *Mañjuśriyamūlakalpa*. The text also influenced the non-Saiddhāntika Śaivism of Kashmir and the Śaiva non-dualists, especially through the *Svacchandatantra*, which adopts and adapts more than a thousand of its verses (p. 17). The *Niśvāsa* was formed before the Śaiva schools had split into their distinct traditions of the Śaivasiddhānta and so on, although the text does contain the list of the twenty-eight Tantras considered as scriptural authority by that school, including itself.

The Tantra comprises five books, *Niśvāsamukha*, *Mūlasūtra*, *Uttarasūtra*, *Nayasūtra*, and *Guhyasūtra*. The earliest of these is the *Mūlasūtra*, to which was added as a commentary the *Uttarasūtra*, with the *Nayasūtra* as an expansion and further commentary. The *Niśvāsamukha* contains material from the non-tantric background. The publication under review contains the *Mūlasūtra*, *Uttarasūtra* and *Nayasūtra*. The *Guhyasūtra* and *Niśvāsamukha* will be separate publications. The earliest kernel of the text is the *Mūlasūtra*, although all four sūtras had attained their present form by the seventh century, with the earliest layers a hundred years or more before (possibly dating back as far as the fifth century). The editors present thorough evidence for their reasoning about the range of dating for the different layers of the text, discussing paleographic, iconographic, terminological, sociological, and theological archaisms.

The theological archaisms are of particular interest, mostly the absence of doctrines that were to become important in later Śaivasiddhānta. There is no mention of philosophical dualism between self and Śiva, no mention of the impurity (*mala*) that blocks the soul from realizing its innate omnipotence and omnipresence, and no systematic account of the six initiatory paths (*ṣaḍadhvan*) found in later literature, but many of these doctrines are incipient in the *Niśvāsa*. The doctrine of the five *kalā*s, the powers that pervade divisions of the cosmos, is later than the *Niśvāsa*, although there are four divisions (*kalā*) of God and four divisions of the Lord's Śakti that later increase to five, thereby lending itself more readily to homologization with other elements of the cosmos. The only initiatory path in the text is that of the hierarchy of worlds (*bhuvana*) that includes the Sāṅkhya categories or *tattva*s as a layer within the scheme, making the doctrine of the *Niśvāsa* close to that of the Atimārga. The list of *tattva*s is evolving in the text; thus there is no mention of them in the *Mūlasūtra*, a short list occurs in the *Uttarasūtra*, which is amplified in the *Guhyasūtra*, and only in a later text, the *Dīkṣottara*, does the full list of thirty-six appear. The editor provides a useful table showing the growth of the *tattva* doctrine through the early texts (p. 45). Apart from the absence of doctrines developed in the later Śaivasiddhānta, there is also an absence of social rites, particularly death rites that we find in later literature and festivals (*utsava*), indicating that the religion of the *Niśvāsa* was not institutionalized but was a new movement, "a religion of spell-masters questing for empowerment (*bhukti*) and liberation (*mukti*)" (p. 59). There are two rites of initiation, the *vidyādīkṣā*, qualifying the initiate for mantra practice, and the *nirvāṇadīkṣā*, guaranteeing liberation. Although the elaboration of later ritual has not yet developed, there is an early account of the installation (*pratiṣṭhā*) of the *liṅga*, as well as of yoga. As in the traditional yoga of Patañjali, magical accomplishments are highly regarded, although with the *Niśvāsa* we have the addition of ritual to achieve magical ends such as disappearance, speedy traversal of great distance, the subjugation of others (*vaśīkaraṇa*), wealth, the destruction of villages and towns, and attaining a supernatural being (*vetāla*) as a slave (pp. 77–78).

There is a useful summary of contents and a statement about the sources and editorial policies. Four manuscripts were used in the preparation of the edition, the oldest being a ninth-century Nepalese palm-leaf manuscript and the others being twentieth-century apographs. The editor gives a fascinating description of the manuscripts along with a detailed account of the script showing variations of letters. Rather than offer a diplomatic edition the editors have combined this with a critical apparatus to form a single, readable edition. The editor provides remarks on peculiarities of language. Tantric texts contain non-standard forms of language called "aiśa," such as irregular case usage, locatives for various other case endings, genitive for dative, passive verbs for active, plural for singular, and so on.

In placing this book within a wider context, we can say that it is a very important publication for our understanding the history of Indian religions and tantric Śaiva tradition in particular. Alexis Sanderson, along with a small group of scholars, has opened up the "Śaiva Age" for the wider scholarly community and this book is one of the fruits of that initiative. The principal editor Dominic Goodall has

produced a first class text along with an erudite and clearly written introduction. I wondered about the title, which is left untranslated, thinking that it may refer to the text being "breathed out" by Śiva, but the *Uttarasūtra* 5.50-51 offers a *nirvacana* that those who study with text will cease sighing because they will be released from bondage.

The importance of this publication lies in showing the continuities between the early tantric tradition and what preceded it and in showing the distinctiveness of that tradition with its equal emphasis on magical accomplishment and pleasure in higher worlds, along with the attainment of final salvation. This book provides solid evidence for an early date for the earliest layers of the tantric tradition and further evidence for the influence of the Śaiva magical material on Buddhist texts. The *Niśvāsa* is the earliest Tantra so far discovered, pushing the dates back into the Gupta period. This is an exemplary edition with an excellent introduction, clear devanāgarī typeface with *apparatus criticus*, a translation that allows the reader to read the original with competence, along with copious notes and appendices of extracts from other texts relevant to understanding the first three sūtras. I look forward to reading the two further volumes that will complete the text.

Gavin Flood
Oxford University

Tantric Studies: Fruits of a Franco-German Project on Early Tantra. Edited by Dominic Goodall and Harunaga Isaacson. Collection Indologie, no. 131, Early Tantra Series, no. 4. Pondichéry: Institut Français de Pondichéry, Paris: École Française D'Extrême-Orient, Hamburg: Asien-Afrika-Institut, Universität Hamburg, 2015. Pp. xxix + 305, figs.

This book, as the title reflects, is the outcome of a Franco-German project on early Tantra funded for over three years by the Agence Nationale de la Recherche and the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft. The preface tells us how the volume came about as the result of three workshops in Kathmandu, Pondicherry, and Hamburg whose primary focus was the reading of texts that have already appeared or will appear in this series but that also contained presentations of papers. It is some of these articles that comprise the book under review, inspired by an important article of Alexis Sanderson, "History through Textual Criticism in the Study of Śaivism, the Pañcarātra and the Buddhist Yoginītantras." Eight "articles" make up the book along with some very fine color illustrations and an index.

The introductory article by Dominic Goodall and Harunaga Isaacson, "On the Shared 'Ritual Syntax' of the Early Tantric Traditions," is the longest by far (pp. 1–76), discussing shared ritual features of early tantric traditions. This is an important article in providing an overview of tantric ritual features such as mantra and the shared ritual technology reflected in the early texts. The use of non-Vedic mantras is a feature of the early works whose importance is reflected in the very name of tantric Śaivism, the *mantramārga*, the 'path of mantras', that the authors point out is also found in Buddhist sources. The authors describe the formation of mantras, how they begin with the *dīpika* OṂ and end with what is called a *jāti*, such as SVAHĀ or HUṂ. The article explains different kinds of mantra, paying particular attention to the heart-mantra that is presented in some detail as both one of the limbs or *aṅga* mantras as well as the essence of the deity.

Not only mantras but also the rituals in which they are used are the sources of power and liberation. The Vedic fire ritual (*homa*) is particularly important, as fire rites are attested over a wide geographical area within the parameters of a Hindu worldview in Tibet, East Asia, and Java and Bali. Such rites have been the topic of scholarly attention for some time, but as the authors observe, only more recently can a fuller picture begin to emerge with the inclusion of the Śaiva and Vaiṣṇava mediation of the Vedic ritual (pp. 19–20). There is an interesting discussion of *homa*, including types of firewood that is itself used as oblation. Some of these practices are likely from a pre-tantric ritual heritage. The *maṇḍala* as a pervasive ritual diagram is attested for the first time in early tantric sources and we have a developed magical technology for the subduing of enemies, traversing long distances, and so on. In this respect