produced a first class text along with an erudite and clearly written introduction. I wondered about the title, which is left untranslated, thinking that it may refer to the text being "breathed out" by Śiva, but the *Uttarasūtra* 5.50-51 offers a *nirvacana* that those who study with text will cease sighing because they will be released from bondage.

The importance of this publication lies in showing the continuities between the early tantric tradition and what preceded it and in showing the distinctiveness of that tradition with its equal emphasis on magical accomplishment and pleasure in higher worlds, along with the attainment of final salvation. This book provides solid evidence for an early date for the earliest layers of the tantric tradition and further evidence for the influence of the Śaiva magical material on Buddhist texts. The *Niśvāsa* is the earliest Tantra so far discovered, pushing the dates back into the Gupta period. This is an exemplary edition with an excellent introduction, clear devanāgarī typeface with *apparatus criticus*, a translation that allows the reader to read the original with competence, along with copious notes and appendices of extracts from other texts relevant to understanding the first three sūtras. I look forward to reading the two further volumes that will complete the text.

GAVIN FLOOD
OXFORD UNIVERSITY

———————————————

Tantric Studies: Fruits of a Franco-German Project on Early Tantra. Edited by DOMINIC GOODALL and HARUNAGA ISAACSON. Collection Indologie, no. 131, Early Tantra Series, no. 4. Pondichéry: INSTITUT FRANÇAIS DE PONDICHÉRY, Paris: ÉCOLE FRANÇAISE D'EXTRÊME-ORIENT, Hamburg: ASIEN-AFRIKA-INSTITUT, UNIVERSITÄT HAMBURG, 2015. Pp. xxix + 305, figs.

This book, as the title reflects, is the outcome of a Franco-German project on early Tantra funded for over three years by the Agence Nationale de la Recherche and the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft. The preface tells us how the volume came about as the result of three workshops in Kathmandu, Pondicherry, and Hamburg whose primary focus was the reading of texts that have already appeared or will appear in this series but that also contained presentations of papers. It is some of these articles that comprise the book under review, inspired by an important article of Alexis Sanderson, "History through Textual Criticism in the Study of Śaivism, the Pañcarātra and the Buddhist Yoginītantras." Eight "articles" make up the book along with some very fine color illustrations and an index.

The introductory article by Dominic Goodall and Harunaga Isaacson, "On the Shared 'Ritual Syntax' of the Early Tantric Traditions," is the longest by far (pp. 1–76), discussing shared ritual features of early tantric traditions. This is an important article in providing an overview of tantric ritual features such as mantra and the shared ritual technology reflected in the early texts. The use of non-Vedic mantras is a feature of the early works whose importance is reflected in the very name of tantric Śaivism, the *mantramārga*, the 'path of mantras', that the authors point out is also found in Buddhist sources. The authors describe the formation of mantras, how they begin with the *dīpika* OṂ and end with what is called a *jāti*, such as SVAHĀ or HUṂ. The article explains different kinds of mantra, paying particular attention to the heart-mantra that is presented in some detail as both one of the limbs or *aṅga* mantras as well as the essence of the deity.

Not only mantras but also the rituals in which they are used are the sources of power and liberation. The Vedic fire ritual (*homa*) is particularly important, as fire rites are attested over a wide geographical area within the parameters of a Hindu worldview in Tibet, East Asia, and Java and Bali. Such rites have been the topic of scholarly attention for some time, but as the authors observe, only more recently can a fuller picture begin to emerge with the inclusion of the Śaiva and Vaiṣṇava mediation of the Vedic ritual (pp. 19–20). There is an interesting discussion of *homa*, including types of firewood that is itself used as oblation. Some of these practices are likely from a pre-tantric ritual heritage. The *maṇḍala* as a pervasive ritual diagram is attested for the first time in early tantric sources and we have a developed magical technology for the subduing of enemies, traversing long distances, and so on. In this respect

there are interesting parallels between early Śaiva and Buddhist texts that the authors draw our attention to, particularly the use of revolting substances, such as sloughed snakeskin, mongoose hair, and menstrual blood, to achieve magical goals. The authors present interesting gobbets of parallel texts from early sources. Indeed, one of the attractions of this book is the way in which original texts, sometimes given for the first time from manuscripts, are presented and translated such that the reader can easily follow the text with the aid of the translation.

What these texts show is that the early Śaiva communities that produced them, notably the earliest Śaiva tantra, the *Niśvāsatattvasaṃhitā*, were on "the fringes of social Brahmanism" (p. 63), seeing themselves as going beyond social convention and the usual rites of passage in favor of a "higher authority" that empowered them. There were teachers and practitioners (*sādhaka*) in the early tradition, who may have been householders, although there may also have been Mantramārga monasteries as there were for the earlier Pāśupata religion from the fourth century. This is in contrast to the Buddhist tantric tradition, in which the "four assemblies" of early Buddhism (the *bhikṣu*s, *bhikṣuṇī*s, *upāsaka*s, and *upāsikā*s) remained, with the tantric teachers (*ācārya*) and practitioners (*sādhaka/mantrin*) supplementing them. In sum, the Buddhist tantric tradition borrowed material about worldly magic (*laukika siddhi*) from the Śaivas but it took some time for the tantric soteriology based on mantras to be integrated with the existing Mahāyāna system.

One of the pervasive features of Śaiva texts, both dualist and non-dualist, is the hierarchy of thirty-six categories or *tattva*s. This is the doctrine that the universe comprises a series of levels in a graded hierarchy from the pure universe to the impure. These are derived from the twenty-five categories of Sāṃkhya (the soul [*puruṣa*], matter [*prakṛti*] and its evolutes) along with eleven Śaiva ones added on top, of particular importance being time (*kāla*), action (*karman*), and God. In an important article Goodall presents a textual history of the doctrine, showing how the *tattva* hierarchy is absent from the *Mūlasūtra*, the earliest textual layer of the *Niśvāsatattvasaṃhitā*, although in the second textual layer, the *Uttarasūtra*, the distinctively Śaiva categories have been added to those of the Sāṃkhya, and the later *Niśvāsakārikā* presents the complete system of thirty-six. There are at least two early Śaiva developments of the Sāṃkhya scheme that incorporate additional levels. These *tattva*s are homologized with other constituents of the universe, of particular interest being the hierarchy of worlds contained within the *tattva* levels. This mapping of the gradation of worlds (*bhuvanakrama*) onto the gradation of categories (*tattvakrama*) occurs from as early as the seventh century and is the basis for the doctrine of the six cosmic paths (*ṣaḍadhvan*) used especially for ritual purposes when mapped onto the body. Goodall not only presents the early textual history but also explains the conception of the additional *tattva*s, especially the coverings (*kañcuka*) such as *niyati* ('destiny'), a force that ensures "the fruits of actions accrue to their perpetrators" (p. 95), *māyā* as primal matter, and *vidyā* as a reification of the power of language, especially mantra, a lower reflection of the "sonic subtle matter," *śuddha-vidyā-tattva* of the pure cosmos, unaccounted for in the Sāṃkhya scheme (p. 104). Any reader who has puzzled over the thirty-six *tattva*s will find here a fascinating and convincing account.

Peter Bisschop presents a critical edition, synopsis, and discussion of a twelfth-century compendium of texts "culled from a variety of Purāṇas" (p. 113), a Māhātmya, bearing witness to the sanctification of early medieval Vārāṇasī. In particular the text called the *Vārāṇasīmāhātmya* bears witness to a hypaethral yogini temple (there are only fourteen left in existence) and the importance of the worship of these goddesses derived from the root tradition of tantric Śaivism, the Trika. Judit Törzok describes the emergence of the Alphabet Goddess Mātṛkā in early Śaiva Tantras. Mātṛkā is the deification of the alphabet itself and the source of all mantras and treatises; taught in the Śaiva scriptures the Goddess bestows supreme knowledge and is identified with the universe itself and, in a commentary on a text by Kṣemarāja, with the alphabet deity Śabdarāśi who represents non-duality (*abheda*). Diwakar Acharya presents three fragmentary folios of a ninth-century manuscript of an early Bhūta Tantra. The Bhūta Tantras, usually linked with the Garuḍa Tantras, were an early genre of text concerned with magical therapies and exorcism (traditionally emanating from the western face of Śiva known as Sadyojāta). In this text Skanda is the central deity at the center of the ritual diagram (*maṇḍala*). Diwakar Acharya has reconstructed the foliation and presents a translation along with the text. Anna A. Ślaczka observes that major publications on architecture and iconography in Hinduism have not taken into account the Śaiva

material on construction and consecration of temples along with the installation of images, largely because the texts have remained unedited and untranslated. This paper presents two chapters from the *Devyāmata*, an early Śaiva *pratiṣṭhātantra*. Within the same genre of literature, Libbie Mills discusses *bhūtasāṃkhya*, the use of object words for number words in the texts, often for metrical reasons. For example 'one' (*eka*) can be rendered as 'eye' (*netra*) if two syllables are required or *nayana* if three. She proposes that these *bhūtasāṃkhya*s can be used as additional evidence for dating: the greater the preponderance of such terms, the later the text. Finally Péter-Daniél Szántó presents Buddhist material, an edition from manuscript fragments of Abhayākaragupta's *Śrīsamvarābhisamayopāyikā*, also using the text's Tibetan translation, along with a synopsis. This text is located within a particularly rich bundle of manuscripts in the Nepal German Manuscript Preservation Project (NGMPP). This is a *sādhana* (ritual/meditation) text describing in particular visualization of the deities of the *maṇḍala* of the deity Samvara. At the top of a mountain the practitioner should visualize everything dissolved into emptiness and then himself as Samvara with his constituents (*skandha*) identified with different Buddhas. The text describes various visualizations of letters and so on to be undertaken and Szántó situates this in relation to other works of the Vajrayāna in the late Pāla period.

This is an excellent collection of essays that present a range of recent work on the early tantric textual corpus. The book successfully combines the substantial opening essay on the broader contextualization of tantric practices with detailed presentations of particular texts from manuscript sources, mostly from the NGMPP. I only detected one typological error (Frits Staal's name misspelled as Fritz [p. 1 n. 1]—he was sensitive to the confusion of the German with the Dutch rendering of his name) and the book is presented as a very high quality production with a good typescript and wonderful colored plates of manuscripts referred to and sculptures of deities. The book meets the exemplary high standard we have come to expect of this excellent series.

<div align="right">

GAVIN FLOOD
OXFORD UNIVERSITY

</div>

The Verb in Archaic Biblical Poetry: A Discursive, Typological, and Historical Investigation of the Tense System. By TANIA NOTARIUS. Studies in Semitic Languages and Linguistics, vol. 68. Leiden: BRILL, 2013. Pp. xxiii + 351. $162.

The verbal system of Biblical Hebrew (BH) is a hotly debated issue in scholarship. Some of the central questions in the debate concern whether the system is primarily based on tense, aspect, modality, or discourse conditions. Moreover, it is also debated how these categories might apply to each individual verb form. Even though a number of scholars have published linguistic treatments of the verbal system in recent years (e.g., Ohad Cohen, John Cook, Jan Joosten), their research is based primarily on prose texts. What differentiates Notarius' approach is that the corpus of "archaic poetry" demands that she extract a verbal system from poetic texts—an endeavor many linguists would balk at. While Notarius is not the first to attempt a linguistic analysis of the verb in poetry (e.g., Alviero Niccacci), she is the first to do so with the corpus of "archaic poetry." Further, the historical-linguistic aspects of her work bring the discussion beyond previous research. For example, although Niccacci deals with poetry, he does not place much weight on diachronic considerations for explaining the verbal system. Scholars who differ, however, generally limit the diachronic study of the verb to the transformational period between Classical Biblical Hebrew (CBH) and Late Biblical Hebrew (LBH). In this book, however, Notarius is able not only to identify the archaic verbal system of BH, but also to establish it as a legitimate stage in the history of BH (introduction, chapters 1–2).

The first part is comprised of three chapters (1–3). Notarius begins by describing different approaches to analyzing the verbal system in CBH prose, a prerequisite before addressing the verb in poetry. In chapter 2 she mentions some obstacles for interpreting verbal tenses in poetry. For example, the language used in different "poetic" texts is not uniform, but rather displays a "high level of linguistic