

This book did not resolve its topic, but it has assembled contributions from most relevant researchers and deals with almost all relevant sites. Whoever wants to deal with this matter should consult it.

ALEXANDER PRUSS  
UNIVERSITÄT MAINZ

## REFERENCES

- Pfälzner, P. 2012. The Question of Desurbanisation versus Reurbanisation of the Syrian Jazirah in the Late Third and Early Second Millennium BC. In *Looking North: The Socioeconomic Dynamics of the Northern Mesopotamian and Anatolian Regions during the Late Third and Early Second Millennium BC*, ed. N. Lanieri, P. Pfälzner, and S. Valentini. Pp. 51–80. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Quenet, Ph. 2011. Stratigraphy. In *Associated Regional Chronologies for the Ancient Near East and the Eastern Mediterranean*, vol. I: *Jezirah*, ed. M. Lebeau. Pp. 19–47. Turnhout: Brepols.
- Ristvet, L. 2012. Resettling Apum: Tribalism and Tribal States in the Tell Leilan Region, Syria. In *Looking North*. Pp. 37–50.
- Rova, E. 2011. Ceramic. In *Associated Regional Chronologies*. Pp. 49–127.
- Schmidt, C. 2012. The Late Third and Early Second Millennium BC Pottery Tradition in the Syrian Jazirah and Beyond. In *Looking North*. Pp. 163–74.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2013. *Ausgrabungen 1998–2001 in der zentralen Oberstadt von Tall Mozan/Urkeš 4: Die Keramik der Früh-Ġazīra V- bis Alt-Ġazīra II-Zeit*. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.

---

*Die Lebermodelle aus Boğazköy*. By AN DE VOS. Studien zu den Boğazköy-Texten, Beiheft 5. Wiesbaden: HARRASSOWITZ VERLAG, 2013. Pp. 274, 56 pls. €76.

As has long been known, one of the primary methods by which the ancient Mesopotamians, as well as the participants in peripheral cultures partaking of cuneiform civilization, elicited information from their deities was the examination of the internal organs of sacrificial sheep—haruspicy or extispicy. Within this method of divination, inspection of the liver (hepatoscopy) played a major role. Instruction in the reading of the future from livers was undoubtedly predominantly oral, from master to apprentice, but written documentation—a “reference library”—also developed. It is from the surviving scraps of this professional literature that modern scholars have derived their still rudimentary understanding of this ancient “science.”

Two basic types of text comprise this arcane genre: extensive lists of individual observations in casuistic format—“If X is to be seen, then Y will occur”—and clay models of the liver, displaying the particular physical features of the organ in question, each often accompanied by (sometimes abbreviated) inscriptions of the oracles (a better designation than the usual “omens”) thereby indicated.

Hittite culture adopted the cuneiform writing system and along with it various features of Mesopotamian religion, literature, etc. Indeed, excavations at the Hittite capital Boğazköy/Hattusa have yielded the greatest number of model livers (CTH 547) from a single site—fifty-eight, easily eclipsing runner-up Mari with thirty-two. The book under review, the revised version of a 2010 Würzburg dissertation written under the direction of G. Wilhelm, is a full edition of these objects, each presented in excellent photographs and those published here for the first time also in hand-copies (by G. Wilhelm and H. Otten).

De Vos transliterates and translates each model, assigning new sigla (Bo 1 to Bo 58) and providing extensive references to previous studies where relevant. Her philological commentaries are exhaustive and contribute to progress in our knowledge of the technical details of the underlying system of inquiry, the current state of which she conveniently illustrates in a sketch (p. 235, appendix 2). She also establishes that, as in Mesopotamia, the features were interpreted at Hattusa in a fixed, counterclockwise, order (p. 46).

Of the fifty-seven model livers included here—an additional piece has since been published by D. Schwemer *apud* A. Schachner, “Die Ausgrabungen in Boğazköy/Ḫattuša 2013,” *AA* 2014: 120–29—the great majority are inscribed entirely in Akkadian, while four (Bo 8, 17, 36, 37) feature apodoses in the Hittite language.

In her introduction, the author thoroughly evaluates the Hittite examples of this textual genre, situating them within the greater context of the cuneiform scribal world. On the basis of paleography—see the useful, photographically illustrated, sign list (pp. 213–34, appendix 1)—she concludes that those models with unilingual Akkadian texts are to be dated to between 1560 and 1450 B.C.E. (p. 103), while the few that include Hittite were inscribed sometime in the fifteenth century (p. 83).

A thorough comparison with the sign forms attested in documents from Syrian and other Anatolian cities in the first half of the second millennium leads De Vos to propose that those scholars who introduced the making of liver models to Hattusa—and perhaps some of the models themselves (p. 36)—came from northern Syria or southeastern Anatolia (p. 85). Later she is more precise, pointing to the “Raum nördlich von Ḫana/Terqa, westlich des Euphrats” (p. 91), more particularly Halab/Aleppo.

While such an origin would hardly be surprising, the methodology by which De Vos draws her conclusion—focusing in on the unknown geographic location of the source of a manuscript tradition by identifying the preponderance of shared paleographic features appearing in various archives of known provenience—is necessarily fraught with uncertainty. After all, there is no reason that a scribe along with his practices could not have leapfrogged over a region—literate or illiterate—in order to disseminate his knowledge in a non-contiguous location.

Since an extensive review of this work by Yoram Cohen has already appeared (*ZA* 105 [2015]: 121–26), in the remainder of this review I will touch on the importance of the model livers for the reception of Mesopotamian “intellectual property” by the Hittites.

It is generally recognized (e.g., by K. K. Riemschneider, *Die akkadischen und hethitischen Omentexte aus Boğazköy* [Dresden, 2004], xlvi) that the collections of haruspicy oracles found at Hattusa (CTH 548–56) arrived there via Hurrian intermediaries, as demonstrated by the extensive use in them of technical terms in the Hurrian language. Yet none of the model livers employ a single Hurrian or Hurroid word, and must therefore have been brought to Anatolia either before the consolidation of Hurrian civilization in northern Syria and southeastern Anatolia following the brief domination there of the Hittite Old Kingdom, or else have been imported later directly from Babylonia, most likely by visiting or migrating experts. The dating of the manuscripts mentioned earlier makes the latter alternative more likely, and De Vos sees a direct connection to Mesopotamian divinatory traditions (pp. 70, 108–9).

Puzzling, however, are the particular form and comparatively large size of the clay livers from Boğazköy. While the examples from Mari are quite similar to those from Ugarit (see Riemschneider, *Omentexte*, xxxix, 248), of all the pieces pictured by J.-W. Meyer, *Untersuchungen zu den Tonlebermodellen aus dem Alten Orient* (Kevelaer, 1987), Tafeln 1–27, those from the Hittite capital are closely similar only to an apparently unprovenanced model identified by him simply as “Philadelphia 1” (Tf. 27, cf. p. 306). Since the photo reveals what is apparently a museum number inked on the piece (“1580”), it is presumably held in the University of Pennsylvania Museum. If so, given the southern Mesopotamian origin of most of the tablets in the collections of that institution, this example is likely also from that region. (The photos included by Meyer are not clear enough to allow linguistic or paleographic analysis.) This gives us a small clue as to the general area in which the tradition represented by the Boğazköy liver models arose. Unfortunately, outside of Mari, only a handful of liver models of the Old Babylonian period (including YOS 10, 1, 3–5, without provenance) are yet known.

In sum, the discipline of divination seems to have followed diverse paths on its progress from Babylonia to Hatti.

The book is equipped with a bibliography, a glossary of words occurring in the edited sources, and indices of these texts and of other textual citations. My only complaint about De Vos’ treatment of the models is that their physical dimensions have not been provided. Although we are indeed informed (p. 111) that the photos have been reproduced at 75% of actual size, and many of the images do include a rule or measuring rod, the author could easily have supplied accurate measurements of the majority of pieces that are currently available for study. As for editing, I noticed only one substantial error: surely the final sentence on p. 105 should read “Die hethitischen *Apodosen*. . . .”

*Die Lebermodelle aus Boğazköy* will definitely be the standard resource for this material for many years to come and deserves a place in every Assyriological library.

GARY BECKMAN  
UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

*The Unbeatable Light: Melammu and Its Biblical Parallels.* By SHAWN ZELIG ASTER. Alter Orient und Altes Testament, vol. 384. Münster: UGARIT-VERLAG, 2012. Pp. xviii + 421. \$114. [Distributed in North America by Eisenbrauns, Winona Lake, Ind.]

*The Unbeatable Light* est une étude comparative entre les domaines mésopotamien et biblique autour de la notion d'éclat, de rayonnement, véhiculée par le terme akkadien *melammu*. L'auteur souhaite aborder ce phénomène suivant quatre points: la terminologie (avec le lexique employé), les manifestations physiques, les concepts associés, et enfin leurs développements historiques en fonction des différentes sources rencontrées. L'ensemble du volume est divisé en neuf chapitres, complétés par une bibliographie conséquente, et par deux précieux index tant des sources citées que des termes sumériens, akkadiens, ouest sémitiques et hébraïques.

Le premier chapitre sert d'introduction générale à l'ouvrage, présentant le sujet, le choix des sources et la méthode comparative employée. L'auteur opère une distinction entre les parallèles typologiques (un même thème traité différemment entre deux cultures) de ceux historiques (qui témoignent d'un emprunt réel, un contact étroit et une chaîne de transmission entre les deux sources), rappelant ainsi dès le départ que les similitudes ne sont pas nécessairement des emprunts. L'auteur propose ensuite une historiographie de la comparaison dans les domaines des études bibliques et assyriologiques.

Le chapitre 2 est consacré au phénomène de rayonnement émanant des dieux, des héros et des hommes, dans la littérature mésopotamienne. L'auteur recense les différents termes sumériens et akkadiens s'y rapportant et retrace l'historiographie de ce terme dans la recherche assyriologique. Thème central de l'étude, le terme *melammu* remplit une fonction rhétorique, soulignant la puissance de celui qui émet ce "rayonnement." Le terme a alors beaucoup en commun avec *puluhtu* la "crainte révérencielle." *Melammu* désigne à la fois un objet concret et un concept abstrait. L'auteur choisit de ne pas analyser les termes sumériens, privilégiant les exemples akkadiens qui constituent, à ses yeux, des comparants plus pertinents pour le domaine biblique.

L'auteur suggère qu'il s'est produit un changement de concept autour du *melammu* au I<sup>er</sup> millénaire av. J.-C. correspondant à un changement de référent physique: à partir du VIII<sup>e</sup> siècle av. J.-C., *melammu* désignerait exclusivement un phénomène d'éclat, pas nécessairement lumineux; il serait aussi concret qu'un vêtement, porté par le roi lors de cérémonies publiques. Parmi les expressions composées autour de *melammu*, l'auteur recense le *melam šarrūti* "l'éclat de royauté" qui aurait désigné un signe de légitimité, un insigne conférant un statut royal à la personne qui le revêtait. L'auteur passe ensuite en revue, un peu rapidement, les attestations des autres termes se rapportant à la splendeur (*namrīrrū*, *rašubbatu*, *šalummatu*, etc.) pourtant tous bien présents dans les exemples utilisés par l'auteur.

Il ne mentionne pas non plus la forme grammaticale surprenante (tous des quadrilatères) de ces termes, que von Soden identifie comme relevant de la catégorie du numineux et du divin (GAG §55p 28 a) III.). Il n'explique pas non plus pourquoi le géant gardien Humbaba possède plusieurs *melammus*. L'auteur clôt son chapitre sur les possibles représentations iconographiques de cet éclat *melammu* dans les reliefs et les sceaux-cylindres.

Les chapitres suivants s'organisent de façon thématique autour des différents phénomènes d'éclats dans le domaine biblique avec la question d'une possible influence de l'akkadien. Le chapitre 3 considère les passages qui décrivent l'éclat de YHWH, en ayant recours à l'imagerie solaire. Le rayonnement manifeste la puissance et la prouesse militaire.

Tandis que les études précédentes voyaient dans les mots hébreux *hod* et *hadar* un parallèle direct avec *melammu* et *puluhtu*, l'auteur nuance cette identification trop simpliste: *hod* renvoie selon lui à la puissance, la force et la domination sur les autres; *hadar* définit une vision qui suscite respect et