become completely transformed from its origin, in a parallel way to the Vajrayāna being almost unrecognizable in early Buddhism. We often associate the Tantras with goddesses, but these Pañcarātra texts attest to a non-feminized form of Tantrism in which the Goddess is not highlighted, in this way reflecting the earlier phase of the Śaiva Siddhānta.

This is a significant contribution to the history of the Pañcarātra, first established by Otto Schrader in his still useful *Introduction to the Pañcarātra*. The explanation of the texts is lucidly clear with extremely useful notes that help the reader relate the text to the broader history of the tantric religions. Full facsimiles of the manuscripts are provided that enable readers to practice their manuscript reading skills and excellent indices are included of pādas, Vedic and Tantric mantras, and a general index. Professor Acharya has performed a great service to the scholarly community in rendering these texts accessible to a wider audience. I look forward to the next two texts in the genre promised by the author, the *Jayottaratantra*, the source of the famous *Jayākhyasaṃhitā*, and the *Vāsudevakalpa*.

Gavin Flood
Oxford University
Yale-NUS, Singapore

Love's Subtle Magic: An Indian Islamic Literary Tradition, 1379–1545. By Aditya Behl, edited by Wendy Doniger. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. Pp. xii + 403. $74.

After Aditya Behl unexpectedly died in 2009, his former adviser Wendy Doniger painstakingly and lovingly put together his unfinished essays into this handsome volume. She has reconstructed, smoothed, and trimmed with skill and attention but the voice remains unmistakably that of Behl. Doniger is at pains to tell us that while the book is not, perhaps, exactly as Behl would have intended, it is not a "patchwork"; it is based on a draft he was expanding and on lectures he delivered in Paris and London in 2004–5 and in 2008.

The nine essays in this volume are on the intriguing story poems, "romances," written in North India between the fourteenth and sixteenth centuries, in mutually intelligible variants of the widespread North Indian vernacular, Hindavī. They were all written by Sufis associated with provincial courts who chose the vernacular in preference to transregional classical languages such as Sanskrit, Arabic, or Persian. Each of these writers belongs to a time, the "long" fifteenth century, when the sultanate of Delhi was reduced to a regional power and North Indian politics was dominated by unstable alliances.

By the fourteenth century Muslims had already lived in India for six hundred years. Islam was no longer foreign to many of the inhabitants of India, and by this time there were many Muslims who had been born in India and who had never known any other land. But if the encounter between Hindus and Muslims was no longer new, the fourteenth century was a time of other encounters between strangers: between country herdsmen and city dwellers, between traveling traders from distant lands, between chiefs and new overlords, and between fortune-seekers and mysterious women. These encounters—often made strange by barriers of language, ethnicity, dress, and ethics—begat new stories and, eventually, new literatures. The *prema kahānī* ("love story") genre discussed in this book is one of desire and longing—of love of the stranger, of encounters with the wilderness and the seduction of the city—born out of the great ferment beginning in the fourteenth century that drew young men to seek employment in the many regiments or ascetic collectives of the time or to make a living from the opportunities of the new towns. As new towns grew, often encompassing older, simpler settlements and rough garrison stops, North India came to be dotted with small towns connected by roads increasingly trodden by armies and travelers. It was in such towns that the texts discussed in this volume were written.

The *prema kahānī*s are entertainment and were "ritually performed in Sufi shrines to awaken the novice to spiritual realities" (p. 1), but they also have more elusive qualities, often impenetrable to modern readers. It is this subtlety to which Behl (or his editor) alludes in the book's title, *Love's Subtle Magic*, and it is in the elucidation of this subtlety—both of the genre and of individual texts—that the

value of this volume lies. Chapter 3 is about one of the earliest of the genre, the *Cāndāyan*, written by one Maulānā Dā'ūd for the delectation of a provincial North Indian court in 1379. No complete manuscript of the *Cāndāyan* exists, although there are a number of damaged and incomplete versions, including at least five illustrated manuscripts. All surviving manuscripts suggest an audience that was "multiliterate and multicultural" (p. 61). For Behl the *Cāndāyan* is a literary watershed as well as a manifestation of the new comfort the immigrant Muslim élite felt with the poetry and conventions of North India. While elements of the narrative are very like those of the Lorik-Chandaini ballads of eastern Uttar Pradesh and central India, the *Cāndāyan* is a complex text containing Indian and Persian generic set-pieces such as the *bārāhmāsa*, a poem describing twelve months of separation from the beloved, or the *sarāpā*, a head-to-foot description of the beloved, woven into the narrative in a way that Behl describes as "both assimilative and competitive" in order to create "a distinctive Sufi poetics of *prema-rasa,* a *desī* Islam" (p. 63). *Prema-rasa* is not, of course, merely human love; it stands for a Chishti-inspired seeking for the divine translated into Indic poetic tropes. After a skillful discussion of Islamic and Indic erotologies that comprise *prema-rasa*, Behl turns to discussing the story of Lorik, who seeks Cāndā, another man's wife (or, in Chishti terms, the formless absolute in embodied female form), while repudiating his own wife Mainā. The love triangle, Behl suggests, is indexical of the fourteenth-century Sufi's position in the world: "If the relation between Lorik and Cāndā is the relation between the Sufi and Allah, then the relation between Lorik and Mainā is the relation between the Sufi and the world" (p. 83). Behl's suggestive parting argument in the chapter sees Dā'ūd's dual cultural position as reflected in the narrative structure of the *Cāndāyan*. For Dā'ūd, who was a poet as well as a Chishti Sufi, and a "Persian-speaking Turkish Muslim with a central Asian ancestry and a desi speaker of Hindavī and eager enthusiast of local poetry," Lorik's dual allegiances and the eventual concord between the two wives are "part of a negotiation of social tensions between Sufis and rulers, between Indian and Islamic identities" (p. 108).

Another chapter is on the love story of the prince and the magic doe-woman, *Mirigāvatī*, written by Shaikh Quṭban Suhravardī in 1503, at the court-in-exile of Sultan Ḥusain Shāh Sharqī. (Behl's translation of this text was published posthumously in 2009.) While elements of the story are similar to the *Cāndāyan*, including the ascetic disguise of the hero, his rival wives, and so on, the text belongs to a more aristocratic milieu than its predecessor. Behl's key argument in this chapter pertains to a segment of the text in which the protagonist prince suffers terrifying adventures on his way to find the magic doe in her city of gold, Kancanpur. He is assailed by waves and whirlpools, by serpents and even cannibals. He survives all these disasters by his faith in Allah. As Behl shows, the prince's adventures bear similarities to a number of other story cycles, some contemporary, others much older. These include the Arabic genre of the "marvels of India," which were themselves among the sources of the Sindbād stories of the Arabian Nights as well as stories told by classical Greek and Roman geographers. Antecedents of the Sindbād stories can be found, as he shows, in a number of story-cycles from the subcontinent, from a Nepali Sanskrit version of the *Bṛhat-kathā* (great story) called the *Bṛhat-kathā-śloka-saṃgraha* (collection of verses from the *Bṛhat-kathā*) featuring a merchant named Sānudāsa, to the Tamil *Maṇimekhalai*, and even one of the Buddhist Jātaka tales (the Valāhassa-Jātaka). As Behl demonstrates, the presence of these motifs even in a text produced in inland South Asia in the early sixteenth century brings out the intensely interactive world of those who lived "along the rim of the Indian Ocean, the global economy of the Islamicate world system" (p. 140). Behl's attention to historical context, both immediate and wider-ranging, is one of the most appealing aspect of his essays.

Two chapters follow on the *Padmāvat* of Malik Muḥammad Jāyasī (ca. 1540). In the first, Behl's concern is to demonstrate how Jāyasī's cartographic imagination, drawn from his dual Chishti-Mahdavi allegiances and what Behl calls, with caveats, a "competitive syncretism" (p. 147), helped him map "a fantasy landscape and an interior landscape of the self" (p. 145), while placing his protagonists firmly in the local environment of northeastern India. Reuse is often considered to be one characteristic of Muslim architecture in India. In the next chapter Behl shows how Jayasī's use of the popular Rajput story of the queen Padminī, a "key historical fiction of later Hindu nationalism," may also be read as an instance of reuse, this time of tropes from Rajput martial texts which he adapted into the romance form and set in the context of the Turkish political consolidation in North India. Behl is careful to warn that

Jāyasī's use of Rajput chivalric tropes should not be read as "self-identification" with Rajputs. Instead, he suggests that the *Padmāvat* uses conquest themes to claim Chishti superiority while taking down the Delhi sultans' claims to universal power (p. 199).

Two chapters on the *Madhumālatī* of Shaikh Mīr Sayyid Mañjhan Shaṭṭārī Rājgīrī, written in 1545 (also translated by Behl, with Simon Weightman, in 2000), are followed by a final chapter titled "Hierarchies of Response," an attentive meditation on the contexts of reception of Hindavī courtly poetry, from performative aesthetics to reading practices and the role of meditative music. The volume is sprinkled with many of Behl's characteristically effective translations and occasional detours (my favorite is one on cats in Sufi literature). With its subtle readings, its steadfast rigor in contextualization, and its thorough dismissal of the sectarian binaries within which such texts have been traditionally read, the book is a illuminating, cosmopolitan, and continually insightful read and a wonderful testament to Behl's lasting place in South Asian scholarship.

Samira Sheikh
Vanderbilt University

The Four Hundred Songs of Love: An Anthology of Poems from Classical Tamil. The Akanāṉūṟu. Translated and annotated by George L. Hart. Regards sur l'Asie du Sud/South Asian Perspectives, no. 7. Pondichéry: Institut français de Pondichéry, 2015. Pp. xx + 485. Rs. 1000, €43.

Like most of the other poems from the Old Tamil (or *caṅkam*) corpus, those of the *Akanāṉūṟu* ("400 Poems in the *Akam* or 'Love' Genre") were most likely composed in the first three centuries of the common era, and subsequently organized into anthologies in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries by Pāratam Pāṭiya Peruntēvaṉār. Also known as the *Neṭuntokai*, the "long anthology" or "the collection of long poems," its poems range in length from thirteen to thirty-one lines and represent the work of 142 poets. George L. Hart, who has done more than any other scholar to ensure that these texts become available to English readers, has done us yet another great service with this translation.

This anthology is known for its unique organization according to *tiṇai* or "landscape," the literary device that best characterizes *caṅkam* poetry. In the *Akanāṉūṟu*, all of the odd-numbered poems are *pālai*, those of the wasteland, which treat themes of estrangement, discomfort, separation, and elopement. The poems ending in "2" and "8" are *kuṟiñci*, those of clandestine love before marriage and usually set at night in the hills or under the cover of millet fields. The poems ending in "4" are *mullai*, set in fragrant forests in the rainy season and treat themes related to patient waiting after marriage, most usually as the wife, accompanied by her girlfriend, awaits the return of her husband from the *pācaṟai* or "war camp," where he is in service to his king. The poems ending in "6" are *marutam*, set in cultivated riverine tracts and largely concerned with infidelity and sometimes spoken by the *parattai*, the wife's rival. Finally, the poems ending in "0" are *neytal* and are composed on themes related to anxious separation and lamentation both before and after marriage and set at the seashore.

Hart begins the book with a gentle—and very general—introduction to the poems of the *Akanāṉūṟu*, discussing their portrayals of "village" and "psychic" realities, noting that the poems contain "nothing otherworldly or rarefied" (p. vi). The translated poems that Hart uses as examples are difficult to read, giving us a sense of what lies before us in the body of the book, and I must admit that I am missing Hank Heifetz's touch (Heifetz is a poet who collaborated with Hart on his translations of two other Tamil texts, the *Puṟanāṉūṟu* and the "Forest Book" of Kampaṉ's *Rāmāyaṇa*). Hart also provides a very brief but useful introduction to "suggestion" in Tamil poetics, the devices of *uḷḷuṟai uvamam* ("implied comparison") and *iṟaicci-p-poruḷ* ("indirect suggestion") (pp. viii–ix).

I reviewed the Hart and Heifetz translation of the *Puṟanāṉūṟu* in *The Journal of Asian Studies* over a decade ago, and my complaints about the introduction to that book also hold true for this one. After all of his close work on this rich and important text, Hart seems to have nothing much to say about it, other than what has been said many times before about *caṅkam* poetry in all kinds of other sources.