

case studies (kouros, mosaics), rejecting the term “appropriation” in favor of agency in art, to explain Phoenician response to Greek forms.

While those seeking a comprehensive study of Phoenician art will not find it in this book, readers have much to gain from Martin’s hope that Greek and Phoenician art remain “contested spaces,” and may well learn as much about the Achaemenid world as about Greece and the Levant. Throughout her wide-ranging investigation, Martin pays close attention to Phoenician inscriptions, including bilingual texts from Greece cited and analyzed in full (the funerary stele from the Athenian Kerameikos would have benefitted from an illustration). The illustrations, especially the color plates, are excellent and greatly appreciated; errors are few (largely mistyped names in references), style throughout is clear, and this book deserves its modest price.

SARAH MORRIS
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, LOS ANGELES

REFERENCES

- Aliquot, J., and C. Bonnet, eds. 2015. *La Phénicie Hellénistique: Actes du colloque international de Toulouse (18-20 février 2013)*. Lyon: Maison de l’Orient et de la Méditerranée—Jean Pouilloux.
- Bonnet, C. 2014. Phoenician Identities in Hellenistic Times: Strategies and Negotiations. Pp. 282–98 in Quinn and Vella 2014.
- Feldman, M. 2014. *Communities of Style: Portable Luxury Arts, Identity, and Collective Memory in the Iron Age Levant*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press.
- Jigoulov, V. 2010. *The Social History of Achaemenid Phoenicia: Being Phoenician, Negotiating Empires*. London: Equinox Press.
- Martin, S. 2012. Review of Jigoulov 2010. *Review of Biblical Literature*. Society of Biblical Literature. www.bookreviews.org.
- Morris, S. 2003. Islands in the Sea: Aegean Politics as Levantine Neighbors. In *Symbiosis, Symbolism and The Power of the Past: Ancient Israel from the Late Bronze Age through Roman Palestine*, ed. W. Dever and S. Gitin. Pp. 3–15. Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns.
- Moscatti, S. 1988. *I Fenici*. Milan: Bompiano.
- Quinn, J. C., and N. Vella, eds. 2014. *The Punic Mediterranean: Identities and Identification from Phoenician Settlement to Roman Rule*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press.
- Suriano, M. 2011. Review of Jigoulov 2010. *JAOS* 131: 688–90.
- Vella, N. 2014. The Invention of the Phoenicians: On Object Definition, Decontextualization and Display. Pp. 24–41 in Quinn and Vella 2014.

Edith Porada zum 100. Geburtstag: A Centenary Volume. Edited by ERIKA BLEIBTREU and HANS ULRICH STEYMANS. *Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis*, vol. 268. Fribourg: ACADEMIC PRESS, 2014. Pp. xv + 642, illus. FS 184.

So much has been written about Edith Porada (1912–1994), *Doyenne der Vorderasiatischen Archäologie*, that one wonders whether a review of another memorial volume could contribute any new observations on either her or her work. Before her death in 1994 there had already appeared two *Festschriften*, Farkas, Harper, and Harrison (1986) and Kelly-Buccellati et al. (1986). A memorial volume, Owen and Wilhelm (1995), was published soon after her death, and many obituaries have been written by her former students. Like so many of my peers, however, my own early intellectual development was deeply influenced by Dr. Porada’s scholarship, and I spent one year (1988–1989) visiting her in the famous apartment on 119th Street in New York City, the two of us poring over photographs of the seals from the Fortification archive from Persepolis. The arrival of *Edith Porada zum 100. Geburtstag: A Centenary Volume* was in fact a refreshing and rewarding opportunity to engage in a concerted man-

ner once again with the individual who, with Henri Frankfort, shaped the discipline of ancient Western Asiatic glyptic studies.

The title of this volume is perhaps a bit misleading. First, this work is from cover to cover about seals and sealing; thus, the many other areas of Dr. Porada's research interests are not addressed. Second, this book is principally a *Kleine Schriften* (by no means comprehensive), republishing twenty articles from the period 1938 to 1992. The editors note (p. xii) that they have targeted articles that appeared in publications that had a less wide circulation. Third, the book contains a "review" of her 1934 dissertation on Akkadian cylinder seals, written under the direction of Viktor Christian at the Universität Wien.

The book opens with a bibliography of Dr. Porada's publications and an interesting essay, *Leben und Werke*, on the life of Dr. Porada written by E. Bleibtreu. The essay provides an overview of the development of her research interests and academic career, but concentrates on the early years of her life and academic career in Vienna. The essay is accompanied by several photos documenting Dr. Porada's life in Hagengut, a rural estate that her father had purchased in Lower Austria, a place where Dr. Porada often spent her summers.

There follow the *kleine Schriften*, organized into three sections: I. *Siegelsammlungen*, II. *Methoden*, III. *Ost-West-Transfer*. Each section is introduced by an essay (in the case of *Siegelsammlungen*, three essays) that provides some context for the articles that follow and/or expands upon some issue raised in those articles. These essays were written by former students and colleagues of Dr. Porada.

I. *Siegelsammlungen*: Dr. Porada was well known as a connoisseur of glyptic arts. This reputation was developed at the beginning of her career when, as research for her dissertation, she studied unpublished seal collections held by many museums and private individuals. Once she moved to America, this expertise led to invitations to work on the excavated seal impressions from Nuzi and the unprovenanced seals in the Pierpont Morgan Collection in New York City. The publication of the glyptic from Nuzi (1947) was groundbreaking, being one of the earliest publications of an excavated corpus of seal impressions (rather than simply a random collection of actual seals purchased on the art market). The seals in the Pierpont Morgan Collection were collected principally owing to their virtuosic craftsmanship, striking themes, and/or interesting iconography; i.e., many were glyptic masterpieces. Dr. Porada used the publication of these seals (1948) as a vehicle to provide a thought-provoking introduction to the history of ancient glyptic. That publication, along with Frankfort (1939), served as the two principal overviews of the stylistic development of ancient glyptic for a generation.

Four of Dr. Porada's articles concerning seal collections (or individual seals or seal impressions in those collections) are republished in this section. The collections include those in the Studium Biblicum Franciscanum in Jerusalem, at Columbia University, and in the Pierpont Morgan Library (two articles). There are four introductory essays in this section. I. Ziffer provides one essay, on the Akkadian seals formerly in the Hahn-Voss Collection (now in Jerusalem), and a concordance of the seals in the Franziskanerklosters Flagellatio collection in Jerusalem (published by Porada in 1938). The focus is upon the Akkadian seals that were included in Dr. Porada's dissertation (1934). H. U. Steymans discusses a handful of Akkadian seals formerly in the Sarre Collection (and also included in Dr. Porada's dissertation). B. Feller's essay concerns the representation of horses in Middle Assyrian style cylinders. The connection here is that the tablets that carry these impressions, excavated at Assur, are in the Vorderasiatisches Museum in Berlin, another collection that Dr. Porada consulted for her dissertation.

The years following World War II were a heady time for collectors. This section of the book evokes a period when ancient artifacts moved freely between collectors and museums. From our perspective today, especially given the destruction and removal of ancient artifacts in Syria and Iraq, it is a bit disconcerting to revisit such a time. Glyptic specialists today would less readily undertake a research agenda whose goal was the publication of unprovenanced material in private and museum collections.

II. *Methoden*: The Edith Porada method, if I may be so bold, consisted of: 1) a long period of looking at a seal image; 2) the careful and precise drawing of that image; 3) exacting and detailed written description of the image; 4) close analysis of even the smallest details of style, composition, iconography, and carving technique in comparison with seal imagery from provenanced contexts so as to yield insights into the original cultural context and meaning of the design.

This method differed principally from what one may call the textual approach, which sought to explain the imagery on seals via the surviving literary record (regardless of the temporal distance between image and text). In her review of the very unusual publication by F. Digard (1975), Porada wrote: “These [works of art = cylinder seals] deserve as full a description, that is a visual analysis, as the writer can provide. Such a description can only be made after a long and intensive exposure to the work, from which the writer derives joy and experiences a growth of knowledge. Such a perception of art is thus not only an intellectual but also a sensual and emotional experience and the source of many of our insights. In the resulting description, the writer acquaints the reader with the work, prepares him for the recognition of the style, and in some cases even for the interpretation of the iconography” (p. 235 in the book under review, from a review article written in 1982). The same review touches on various related points; e.g., “the intimate association with the object also produces what E. Gombrich called ‘imaginative participation’ which one has to attain in order to understand and properly interpret a work of art” (p. 236). These passages provide insight into another aspect of Dr. Porada’s method, intuitive leaps of interpretation based upon a deep reservoir of visual knowledge. (Note also the comments of Pittman in her article, pp. 375–76.)

Six of Dr. Porada’s articles are republished in this section. These articles focus upon individual seals or a group of seals related by theme and/or iconography, ranging in time from the Akkadian period to the Neo-Babylonian and in space from Cyprus to Iran. M. Novák provides an introductory essay that reviews each of the republished articles and provides a few thoughts on the relationship of Dr. Porada’s method to current research trends in the discipline: “Edith Porada war sicherlich keine Theoretikerin; weder bezieht sie sich auf eine der damals viel diskutierten kunsttheoretischen Schriften eines Henrich Wölfflin, Erwin Panofsky oder Guido Kaschnitz von Weinberg noch stellte sie selbst theoretische Konzepte einer kunstgeschichtlichen Analyse der Bilderwelt des Alten Orients auf . . . Gegenüber den Arbeiten ihrer Zeitgenossen—und als solche sollen durchaus auch die beiden eingangs bereits genannten, etwas älteren Forscher Henri Frankfort und Anton Moortgat gelten—zeichnet sich die Methodik Edith Poradas dadurch ab, dass sie erheblich vorsichtiger in der inhaltlichen Deutung und auch der ethnischen Zuweisung von Motiven und Typen in der Bildkunst war” (p. 173). D. Collon closes this section of the book with a remembrance of Dr. Porada as a teacher.

III. *Ost-West-Transfer*: While Dr. Porada began her career on the most mainstream of glyptic subjects, Akkadian, and while one of her most influential early publications concerned one of the premier collections of mainstream Mesopotamian glyptic, the Pierpont Morgan Collection, her most enduring contributions to the study of ancient glyptic lay outside the southern Tigris-Euphrates nexus, in Cyprus, the Aegean, Syria, northern Iraq, and Iran. The glyptic of these areas often exhibits complex interweaving of style, composition, and iconography from various centers. Dr. Porada excelled at recognizing nuances of style and iconography and tracking the potential origins and modes of transfer.

Ten of Dr. Porada’s articles are republished in this section. The Aegean, Cyprus in particular, is the recurring focus in most of these articles. J. Aruz provides an introductory essay that reviews some of the material discussed in the republished articles, highlights some recent studies, and summarizes the importance of Dr. Porada’s contributions concerning the complex interactions between cultures in the eastern Mediterranean in the Middle Bronze Age. The seals from the so-called Tôd Treasure and the glyptic hoard found at Thebes in Egypt figure prominently. H. Pittman closes this section with an essay that integrates three unprovenanced seals that Dr. Porada had assigned to southeastern Iran (of the third millennium BC) with a corpus of glyptic that has emerged from recent excavations at Konar Sandal South in Kerman province. Pittman concludes that although Dr. Porada took two risks, dealing with unprovenanced material and relying on intuition in attempting to contextualize that unprovenanced material, those seals and her analyses “have contributed significantly to our reconstruction of the styles and imagery typical of the Iranian plateau in the Bronze Age” (p. 391).

E. Porada’s Dissertation (1934): The last section of the book is an overview of Dr. Porada’s unpublished dissertation on Akkadian cylinder seals completed at the Universität Wien (E. Bleibtreu). The bulk of this review consists of a concordance of the seal numbers in that dissertation with later publications of those seals, particularly Boehmer (1965), and Porada’s iconographic index. In many cases where Boehmer (1965) did not illustrate the seal, one is provided in this publication. The concordance is no trivial accomplishment, given that the dissertation catalogued 542 glyptic images.

The editors have done a herculean job in 1) retaining original pagination of the articles that have been reprinted (making citation of the original article an easy task), 2) reprinting the original illustrations (for photos on photographic paper), and 3) adding new drawings and photographs of seals throughout the publication (but especially in the review of her dissertation). The book is a wonderful tribute to Dr. Porada and her intellectual legacy.

MARK B. GARRISON
TRINITY UNIVERSITY, SAN ANTONIO, TX

REFERENCES

- Boehmer, R. M. 1965. *Die Entwicklung der Glyptik während der Akkad-Zeit*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Digard, F. 1975. *Répertoire analytique des cylindres orientaux: Publiés dans des sources bibliographiques éparses (sur ordinateur)*. Paris: Editions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.
- Farkas, A. E.; P. O. Harper; and E. B. Harrison, eds. 1986. *Monsters and Demons in the Ancient and Medieval Worlds: Papers Presented in Honor of Edith Porada*. Mainz: Philipp von Zabern.
- Frankfort, H. 1939. *Cylinder Seals: A Documentary Essay on the Art and Religion of the Ancient Near East*. London: Macmillan.
- Kelly-Buccellati, M.; P. Matthiae; and M. N. van Loon, eds. 1986. *Insights through Images: Studies in Honor of Edith Porada*. Malibu: Undena Publications.
- Owen, D. I., and G. Wilhelm, eds. 1995. *Edith Porada Memorial Volume*. Bethesda, MD: CDL Press.
- Porada, E. 1947. *Seal Impressions of Nuzi*. The Annual of the American Schools of Oriental Research 24. New Haven: American Schools of Oriental Research.
- _____. 1948. *Corpus of Ancient Near Eastern Seals in North American Collections: Vol. 1: The Collection of the Pierpont Morgan Library*. Washington D.C.: Pantheon Books.

Die neuassyrische und spätbabylonische Glyptik aus Tall Šēḫ Ḥamad. Vol. 1: *Text und Konkordanzen*; Vol. 2: *Katalog und Tafeln*. By ANJA FÜGERT. Berichte der Ausgrabung Tall Šēḫ Ḥamad / Dür-Katlimmu, vol. 16. Wiesbaden: HARRASSOWITZ VERLAG, 2015. Pp. lxxviii + 318, ix + 497, illus. €198.

The volume under review, a revision of the author's 2013 Freie Universität Berlin doctoral dissertation written under the supervision of Professor Hartmut Kühne, is a *catalogue raisonné* of 539 seals and distinct seal impressions recovered in Tell Sheikh Hamad Lower Town II. The series in which it is published presents site-specific excavation results, special studies of individual groups of objects, and interdisciplinary research pertaining to Tall Šēḫ Ḥamad.

The site, located on the left bank of the lower Khabur some seventy kilometers north-northeast of Deir ez-Zor, was the location of an Assyrian military and administrative center called Dür-Katlimmu in Akkadian and Magdalu in Aramaic. Excavated by the Freie Universität under the direction of Professor Kühne between 1978 and 2008, the site consists of a Citadel, first settled in the Late Uruk period, and immediately to the east the Lower Town ("Unterstadt") I, dating from the Middle Bronze Age; Assyrian occupation of the Citadel likely began during the reign of Shalmaneser I (ca. 1273–ca. 1244 BCE). The Lower Town was greatly enlarged to the northeast (Lower Town II) during the early eighth century, probably during the reign of Adad-nērārī III (810–783).

The excavation of Lower Town II was subdivided into two main areas of operation, the North-east-Corner ("Nordostecke"), including Building F/W and the City Wall, and Middle Lower Town ("Mittlere Unterstadt") II, including the Neo-Assyrian Residences ("Neuassyrische Residenzen"), a complex of four houses, and the Red House ("Rotes Haus"), a large official building. Together these loci evidence an uninterrupted stratigraphic sequence consisting of three major phases dated from the last third of the ninth to the sixth century. Absolute dates are provided by eighty dated cuneiform archival tablets and seventeen dated docketts, the largest concentration of which were found in the Red House—nearly a third of the more than two hundred tablets and fragments in total record the private