Book Reviews

Julie Patenaude and Garry J. Shaw, *A Catalogue of Egyptian Cosmetic Palettes in the Manchester University Museum Collection* (Manchester, UK: Golden House Publications, 2011). ISBN 9781906137205. Pp. 119, b/w illustrations.

The important work of fully documenting the Predynastic material in museum collections is a vital and often neglected aspect to studies of Egypt's prehistory. Publications often focus on individual pieces possessing unusual iconography whereas the vast majority of this material is deemed "typical" of its artifact class. Any specificity of context that might aid in the construction of more nuanced or detailed interpretation of past cultural differences is lost in vague generalizations about the description and function of an entire class of artifacts, with slight attention being paid to cultural significance or geographic variation.

Part of this difficulty stems from the sheer numbers of prehistoric artifacts that inhabit museums with ancient Egyptian collections. Paradoxically, in the early twentieth century when many of these Predynastic Egyptian cemeteries were being explored, artifacts discovered in these graves were not as highly valued as those bearing inscriptional evidence, while the sheer number of graves containing cultural material far outstripped that of historic period cemeteries. The result was that institutional subscribers to or sponsors of these excavations were inundated with large numbers of artifacts from a variety of sites that to the average Egyptologist carried comparatively little inherent meaning beyond where the artifact placed within the developmental phases of prehistoric Egypt.

Another aspect of this difficulty lies in the original cemetery publications themselves. Faced in some cases with hundreds of graves to choose from, excavators often chose to publish a representative sample of grave groups, while the vast majority of material went unpublished. Where the field notes of the excavator are still extant, this problem can be remedied with some deep research. But in cases where the original excavation data is unavailable, primary contextual information is lost to us.

The result was that the specific context for many of these objects was considered irrelevant. Tomb groups, except in special cases, were broken up and the artifacts sent to multiple institutions. Curators at these museums interpreted a normalized view of Predynastic Egyptian culture where a "typical" burial could be concocted for public display using artifacts from different tombs from a variety of sites so long as it contained a representative sample of the different artifact classes believed to date to the same period.

Worse, for the purposes of modern research, scholars often have great difficulty discovering which institutions hold artifacts from published tomb groups. Even after locating these objects, finding the funding to visit multiple institutions for detailed study creates more obstacles. While institutions with sufficient resources are helping to remedy this problem with the creation of online catalogues of their holdings, in the absence of well researched background for these artifacts, the same barriers to research will exist in the virtual world. Winifred Needler's work on the large collection of Predynastic and Archaic objects in the Brooklyn Museum remains the gold standard for this type of publication; however, few smaller museums have the resources to produce such a comprehensive work even though their collections may be quite substantial.

A welcome effort to tackle all of these issues is offered in Patenaude and Shaw's catalogue of slate palettes from the Manchester University Museum. The catalogue provides records of the 113 palettes in the museum's collection, their donors and their probable date, where available. The authors have also made a concerted effort to pinpoint the original locations of the palettes in their collections and provide full descriptions of the *in situ* finds in the graves either from the original publications or from field notes where this information is available. The authors have also provided sample reproductions of the original field drawings of the graves from which seven of their palettes come. Admirably, the authors also point out two palettes in their collection which are probable forgeries.

Black and white images of all the palettes are provided in addition to their description, though the images are not uniform in scale and only a third of these images include a centimeter bar for reference, obliging

the reader to flip back and forth in the catalogue to find the actual dimensions of most of the objects.

In the analysis section of the catalogue, the authors provide raw counts for each cemetery site from which their palettes come; counts for the phase of Egyptian culture to which their palettes date; counts for the stylistic categories represented in their collection; the sex or age of the palette owner, where known; and the general find spot of the palette whether in a mortuary or settlement site. While all this information is welcome, one cannot help feeling that an opportunity for deeper analysis has been missed. No attempt to analyze the high percentage of female and children buried with palettes versus those buried with men is made. Neither is the uneven geographic distribution of palettes from southern sites to northern sites addressed. Even outstanding examples within the collection, such as the so-called Ostrich Palette (Manchester 5476) featured on the front cover of the book, receive no particular reexamination. The wide temporal and stylistic range of material contained in the Manchester University Museum could have been used in an analysis of body decoration and ornamentation in the composition of Predynastic grave tableaux. Given some of the more interesting anthropological approaches to the Predynastic Egyptian record in the last ten years, including David Wengrow's *The Archaeology of Early Egypt* (2006), it seems a discussion of the role of cosmetic palettes in prehistoric Egyptian life would have complemented the publication of this collection.

This work is listed as the first of a planned series of catalogues from Manchester's collections, raising hopes that that the remainder of the museum's Predynastic objects will be published in future.

Jane A. Hill
Rowan University

Franck Monnier, *Les forteresses égyptiennes. Du Prédynastique au Nouvel Empire,* Connaissance de l'Égypte Ancienne, n° 11 (Brussels: Éditions Safran, 2010). ISBN 978-2-87457-033-9. Pp. 208, 16 plates.

Les forteresses égyptiennes: Du Prédynastique au Nouvel Empire provides an overview of the fortress system and fortified towns of the Eastern Delta and desert, Sinai, Syria-Palestine, Western Desert, and Nubia from the Predynastic through the New Kingdom, and touches upon fortified towns and sites within the Nile Valley proper, usually to demonstrate architectural techniques. The topics are outlined in seven chapters, with subsections, followed by three appendices, and several "annexes," which round out the publication.

Chapter 1: Historical Context gives a brief overview of Egypt's history from the Predynastic period through the New Kingdom, up through the reign of Ramesses XI. Monnier does not include post-Pharaonic military architecture. He also uses ancient Egyptian historical documents in his discussion of Egypt's external contacts.

Chapter 2: Representation of Fortresses and the Architectural Evolution addresses the representation of fortresses in Egyptian art from the Predynastic period through the New Kingdom. This chapter focuses specifically on architectural evolution, although there is slight overlap with chapter 1.

Monnier discusses the depictions of early circular, semicircular, and rectangular enclosures that appear on labels and in tomb scenes. He also introduces the concept of the funerary enclosures at Abydos. The author presents the reader with a very nice table (fig. 11, p. 38) of representations of fortresses from Dynasty 0 through Dynasty 1. The discussion of Dynasty 12 is very brief with a focus on the Nubian fortresses. However, Monnier returns to the issue of the Nubian forts later in the publication. He notes that the "archetypal" fortress plan, often described as the "plains fortress" type, as well as the second phase of the Nubian fortress system is called the "*schema triangulaire*," or the "cataract fortresses."

The author's discussion is enhanced by the inclusion of several nice illustrations. However, the use of illustrations is not consistent; for some sites, the lack of figures was frustrating. Likewise, some of his points were not as thoroughly examined as one might wish, such as the issue of higher water levels during the annual inundation and how the architects dealt with this problem (52–53). In these cases, the lack of references exacerbated the problem.

Monnier's New Kingdom discussion centers on the fortified urban hubs and large temple complexes, rather than true fortified military architecture. This is understandable, however, since some Middle Kingdom fortresses continued to be in use during the New Kingdom, especially in Nubia. Since the southern portion of Egyptian-occupied Nubia was fairly quiet, fortified towns and temple sites were more appropriate to protect the populace from any surprise attacks. While he uses sites such as Deir el Medina, Medinet Habu, and Tell el Dab'a to illustrate the fortified towns, one questions why he does not also discuss similar Nubian sites, such as Sesebī.

In addition to archaeological remains, the author uses contemporary documentation in the form of tomb paintings and other examples, such as the tomb of Mahu (Tomb 9, Tell el Amarna) and its depiction of

fortified architecture. Similarly, Monnier's discussion regarding the fortresses constructed along the Ways of Horus is set in the context of their representations on the north wall of Seti I's hypostyle hall at Karnak. He uses the larger grouping of campaign records at Karnak to review Hölscher's repurposing of Badaway's original set of seven types of fortresses, which Hölscher condensed into four. While the discussion of the types is helpful, it is very brief and it is unclear why the conversation concerning the types is not addressed earlier in the book. Although Monnier introduces the dialogue, he rarely refers back to it in the later chapters.

While Monnier moves easily between archaeological, iconographical, and textual evidence and examples, the organization of the chapter sometimes makes it difficult for the reader to follow. Placing the discussion of the fortress types at the beginning would have allowed him to group, within larger headers, the discussions within their appropriate fortress types (Type 1, Type 2, Type 3, Type 4), but he does not do this. As a result, it is easy to lose one's focus on the examples for the different types.

Chapters 3 through 6 concentrate on a particular geographic area: the Eastern Delta and the Northern Sinai, the "Middle East," the Western Frontier, and Nubia. The chapters are split into mini descriptions of various fortified sites dating from the Old Kingdom through the New Kingdom. The individual site reviews often come with basic bibliography, and are sometimes accompanied by an architectural plan. Although these chapters were the richest in bibliographic references for the reader, Monnier often gives only the basic publications on the sites. This, however, is certainly an asset for the lesser known sites.

Chapter 3: The Fortresses of the Eastern Delta and the Northern Sinai concentrates only on the fortresses of the Eastern Delta and Northern Sinai. It encompasses the time frame from the Predynastic period through to the New Kingdom. He opens the chapter with a geographical description of the northeastern Delta and the northern Sinai; he defines several terms for the reader: "*la zone dunaire*," "*la langue*," "*la zone pélusiaque*," and "*la zone postpélusiaque*."

Monnier's discussion of the Old Kingdom fortified frontier is concerned mainly with titles and place names within Old Kingdom and First Intermediate period texts. He does expand on the Ways of Horus, but this part is the only in-depth examination prior to the Middle Kingdom.

The Middle Kingdom section's focus is concerned with the Walls of the Prince (*inbw ḥḳ3*), which are mentioned in both the Prophecy of Neferti and the Tale of Sinuhe. With this discussion, the author also reintroduces the Ways of Horus. Once he completes his review of the Ways and the Walls, Monnier begins a dialogue concerning the military routes of Seti I. At the end of this discussion, the reader is introduced to a series of fortified sites from Tell Hebua northward to Kom el Qolzoum, in the Isthmus of Suez.

Chapter 4: The Egyptian Fortresses of the Middle East is a discussion of the New Kingdom fortified sites of the Egyptian Syro-Palestinian territory from Sharuhen to Deir el Baleh. Monnier introduces this chapter with a brief discussion on the problems and issues of identification of New Kingdom fortresses in this area. The set up of the site discussions is the same as chapter 3.

Chapter 5: The Fortresses of the Western Frontier is another review of a series of sites, dating to the mid- to late New Kingdom (Dynasties 19 and 20), but this time in the western Delta and the northwestern territory of the Egyptian coast. Monnier reviews the sites starting from Qaret el Dahr (in the Wadi el Natrun) to westernmost fort at Zawiyet Umm el Rakham. Again, he uses the same set up of the site overviews in chapter 3.

Chapter 6: The Nubian Fortresses concentrates on the Nubian fortress system. The introduction to the chapter includes a very brief overview of the basic history of the Egyptian fortress system, as well as a brief discussion on the archaeology of the area. The author also gives a list of fortresses with their modern and ancient names.

Following this, Monnier addresses the "Great Walls," such as those at Aswan, Elephantine, Semna West, and Semna South. His discussion on the fortress system starts with the northern fortified site of Elephantine and then moves southward. He does not separate out the fortresses by date, instead using location as the method of organization. This chapter also has some of the best selection of architectural plans, though this may be due to the fact that many of them were excavated and published during the salvage work that was done to rescue sites before the Aswan dam was finished.

The author also includes the fortified town sites in Nubia, which were constructed during the New Kingdom. These sites include Askha, Amara West, Sai, Sesebï, and Soleb. Although his discussion in some places is short, the author does provide some basic bibliography. The chapter concludes with a review of the literary sources: the Thutmose III stela at Aswan, the list of fortresses from the Ramesseum Onomasticon, the inscriptions from el Girgaoui, the stela at Tombos, and the stela from Kerma.

Although chapter 6 deals solely with the Nubian fortresses, some of the discussion concerning these fortresses occurs in chapter 2. It would seem that chapter 6 would have been made stronger by concentrating the discussion of Nubian fortresses in this chapter. Since

there is significantly more information about the Nubian fortresses, starting off the set of chapters with the Nubian sites, rather than the Eastern Delta fortresses, might have also allowed for a better organization of the material.

Chapter 7: Three Fortresses, which is the last chapter, focuses on three additional fortresses: Tell Ras Budran, Ayn Asil, and Wadi el Hudi. These three sites are at the very edges of the empire and are either located in oases or associated with mines. It is a good basic introduction to the sites. Fortunately, Monnier also includes bibliography at the end of each site discussion.

Appendices: Monnier includes three appendices: "The Walled Cities," "White Wall," and "The Walls of the Palermo Stone: funerary palaces or 'divine fortresses'." Unlike the previous chapters, he does not include site-specific bibliography, which is a disappointment, although the author does include extensive footnotes. The appendices offer the same amount of information as the main chapters. Appendix 1 would have better served the reader as a main chapter, while appendices 2 and 3 could have been easily folded into chapter 2.

After the appendices, there are eight additional sections, or "annexes." These include a general map of Egypt (which might better serve at the beginning of the book), a chronological table (also probably better situated at the front of the book), a glossary of architectural terms, a list of Egyptian terms (hieroglyphs, transliteration, and modern [French] equivalent terms), a list of Egyptian fortresses and fortified sites by their Egyptian names (hieroglyphs, transliterations, and modern [French] names), foundation dates, locations, the general bibliography, and the credits for photos and illustrations. The final entry of the book is a set of seventeen colored plates.

Monnier's first two chapters provide the reader with a historical and architectural introduction to the subject. While necessary, this did result in repetition in the following chapters, which also focus on military architecture of specific areas. Although not an easy problem to solve, better organization of these two chapters and additional references, both external and internal, would allow the reader to further pursue issues raised and provide greater cohesion with the remainder of the book.

Chapters 4 through 6 are the strongest chapters of the book and provide the reader with a short bibliography of each site, which is excellent, particularly because some of the sites are not very well known. I would recommend purchasing the book for these chapters alone. Chapter 7, while a good chapter, could have been expanded. In addition, it is not clear why the specific sites in the chapter were chosen for review as opposed to others: a short introduction to this chapter would have been useful in this regard.

I would have preferred more bibliographic references within the chapters, most especially chapters 1 and 2, but that is a purely personal preference. The appendices were excellent additions and could have been expanded in order to make them into proper chapters, but perhaps external reasons necessitated keeping them as appendices. The "annexes" were very helpful as were the glossary and list of Egyptian-to-modern terms. These formed admirable additions to the book and give the reader handy, well-organized vocabulary references.

Although the book is not an in-depth treatment of fortress sites of Egypt, it is a strong review of the general knowledge of Egyptian military architecture. As a basic introductory reference, it would enhance both institutional and personal libraries for those who are interested in the fortress system of ancient Egypt.

Beth Ann Judas
University of Pennsylvania

Peter F. Dorman and Betsy M. Bryan, eds., *Perspectives on Ptolemaic Thebes: Papers from the Theban Workshop 2006*, SAOC 65 (Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2011). ISBN 978-1-885923-85-1. Pp. xiv + 146; 77 figures, 5 tables.

This volume is the second publication of the Theban Workshop held at the University of Chicago in 2006. The Epigraphic Survey has spent decades copying reliefs and inscriptions from Theban temples of the New Kingdom, but the present book showcases research its members and colleagues have conducted on the later Ptolemaic period.

Ptolemaic Thebes is an excellent subject for interdisciplinary conferences such as this one, since the variety of available evidence attracts diverse specialists in both Pharaonic and Hellenistic history. A major conference focused on this subject in the 1990s (S. P. Vleeming, ed., *Hundred-Gated Thebes*, 1995), and another took place in Brussels in 2005 (A. Delattre and P. Heilporn, eds., "*Et maintenant ce ne sont plus que des villages". Thèbes et sa région aux époque hellénistique, romaine et byzantine*, 2008; not mentioned in the book under review).

Alexandria presents few Hieroglyphic or Demotic documents, and little remains of the great temples of Graeco-Roman Memphis. Thebes, by contrast, preserves over a dozen major temples from this time, as well as tombs, papyri, funerary material, not to mention Greek and Demotic ostraca, papyri, and graffiti.

The present book balances a fascinating variety of perspectives, highlighting new methodologies and avenues of research, including political and socioeconomic history (Manning, Moyer), administrative papyri (Arlt), temple graffiti (Di Cerbo and Jasnow), statuary (Albersmeier), religious texts (McClain), and detailed analysis of royal titularies (Ritner). A relatively quick read, this volume provides an excellent companion to general histories of the period (e.g., Bevan, Hölbl), which rely heavily on classical historical narratives, Greek papyri, and Egyptian royal decrees.

In the preface, the editors emphasize the "separateness" of Thebes during the Ptolemaic period, a region that seemingly resisted Hellenizing cultural and political influences more than other multicultural regions such as Memphis or the Fayyum, most notably because of its major political revolts. Unlike temples at Edfu and Philae, which were built entirely anew under the Ptolemies, Thebes witnessed remarkably few additions to its New Kingdom shrines. Scholars have often suggested this resulted from a grand political strategy of the Hellenistic rulers, privileging neighboring cities (e.g., Ptolemais, Coptos, Edfu) while neglecting the historically significant Theban monuments, ushering in the eventual decline of this city.

Nonetheless, it is important to remember that decoration and restoration took place almost continually in Karnak during this time (see C. Thiers, "*Membra disiecta ptolemaica* I–II," *Cahiers de Karnak* 13, 2010, 373–99; 14, 2013, 467–91), while numerous subsidiary temples were constructed as well, such as Opet, Mut, Montu (North Karnak), Medamud, Deir el-Bahari (Ptolemaic Shrine), Deir el-Medina, Qasr el-Agouz, Armant (Montu temple and Mammisi), and Tod. Thus, while the results are not as visually striking as at Edfu or Dendera, significantly greater resources were provided to the Theban region than scholars generally admit.

Furthermore, Ptolemaic kings and priests appear not to have been interested in radically overhauling the temples in Thebes, but intentionally preserved the Pharaonic buildings and decoration, maintaining the antiquarian prestige of this world-renowned city. Following the lead of Alexander the Great, who restored the inner sanctuaries at Karnak and Luxor, thereby adding archaizing reliefs of himself alongside Thutmosis III and Amenhotep III, subsequent kings sponsored the renewal of New Kingdom texts, including at Medinet Habu and Karnak (cf. McClain and Ritner's essays). As Albersmeier discusses in this volume, local Theban priestesses specifically revived New Kingdom garments and poses for their private statuary, emphasizing their appreciation of the glory days of Karnak.

The authors are all leading experts in their respective areas of specialization, and each essay deserves multiple close readings. Nonetheless, the conference took place in 2006 and was not published until late 2011, and only some of the contributions incorporated more recent bibliography, not to mention additional studies published since then. The following comments are not intended as criticisms, but aim to provide interested readers with bibliography on further developments in these areas of research. In general, there are the two volumes edited by Christophe Thiers (*Documents de Théologies Thébains Tardives [D3T 1-2]*, 2009 and 2013), and the reviewer's own monograph (*Caesar in the City of Amun: Egyptian Temple Construction and Theology in Roman Thebes*, 2012), all of which discuss many of the same questions and sources.

Joseph G. Manning (1–15) suitably introduces the following essays, primarily concerned with Theban sacred institutions, by addressing motivations for Ptolemaic support of building activity in Upper Egypt. He notes that state funds were not mere gifts to the clergy, since strings were usually attached. Increased funding also meant a surge of Ptolemaic bureaucrats and soldiers from Alexandria. Furthermore, this activity was concentrated at strategically or economically important hubs such as Edfu, with access to the Eastern Desert, Red Sea, and Nubian trade routes. Thus "the new temple building in the Thebaid, I believe, was a means by which the Ptolemies gained control of the south" (7).

While Manning focuses on Upper Egypt, it is worth noting that the first two Ptolemies focused almost exclusively on Lower Egyptian temples (Philae and the Mut Temple at Karnak being notable exceptions), since these cities (e.g., Sais, Mendes, Buto, Memphis, Sebennytos, Behbeit el-Hagar, Tanis, Pithom) were the true centers of indigenous elite in the preceding centuries (Dynasties 26–30). It is only under Ptolemy III Euergetes that temple construction really begins in the Thebaid. Why the sudden shift in strategy? Perhaps it is partly due to increased Ptolemaic activity in the Red Sea, but it could also be a direct consequence of the national priestly synods and administrative reorganization initiated during this reign. As Manning notes (1, n. 4), much of the present paper was incorporated into his more recent book (*The Last Pharaohs: Egypt under the Ptolemies*, 2010, especially 84–110).

Carolin Arlt (17–34) studies various scribal institutions in Thebes, and investigates the decline of Demotic and rise of Greek for official documents. From the numerical distribution of surviving documents, Arlt notices two sharp declines in Demotic around 250 and 90 BCE, precisely around the times of two major Theban revolts. Arlt studies prosopographic evidence for native Egyptian notaries (for which see now M. Vierros, *Bilingual Notaries in Hellenistic Egypt: A Study of*

Greek as a Second Language, 2012), and argues that traditional positions of Royal Scribe and Scribe of Amun appear to die out by 220 BCE.

However, Arlt notes that "new sources might change this picture." In fact, a block from Karnak currently in the Brooklyn Museum of Art (16.580.214), preserves extended titles of a Theban priest named Horemhab, who was active under Ptolemy VIII Euergetes II (c. 145–116; C. Traunecker, "Les graffites des frères Horsaisis et Horemheb. Une famille des prêtres sous les derniers Ptolémées," in *Gs. Jan Quaegebeur*, 1995, II, 1192, 1204). Among various duties, he was also "accounting scribe of Amun of the five phyles in Thebes (*sš Ỉmn iw=f (ḥr) ỉp(.t) pȝ zȝ 5-nw n Niw.t*)," and his prominent family had close relations to the Ptolemaic dynasty, holding titles such as Priest of Royal Crowns and Statues. While administrative reforms certainly took place over time, particularly regarding the language of the papyri, at least some Theban temple scribes remained in office. Ongoing research on Ptolemaic statues from the Karnak Cachette may further nuance the chronology of these administrative changes

Christina Di Cerbo and Richard Jasnow (35–51) offer preliminary remarks on their comprehensive documentation of devotional graffiti at Medinet Habu. Although many were published already by William Edgerton, and some translated by Heinz-Josef Thissen, a considerable number remain unedited, including many hieratic texts. Furthermore, rediscovered photographic negatives from the 1920s permit significant revisions to Edgerton's facsimile copies, particularly for damaged graffiti that can no longer be collated in person.

As the authors observe, a large percentage of the graffiti belongs to priests of Montu from Armant to the south of the temple. These dedications were likely inscribed during the Khoiak festival, when Montu and his clergy visited Amun's temple (Klotz, *Caesar in the City of Amun*, 392–97, especially 393, n. 70). Accordingly, the date on the new graffito from roofblock no. 99 (41, 43) can probably be restored to "Khoiak ([IV] Akhet), day 26," just like graffito no. 129.

Sabine Albersmeier (53–67) describes a group of Ptolemaic statuettes belonging to queens and priestesses from Thebes, which revive poses and attributes from the New Kingdom. Since most of these objects come from the Karnak Cachette, additional photographs and updated bibliography can now be found online (http://www.ifao.egnet.net/bases/cachette/). In particular, note that the translation of Doc. 8 (63) should be modified slightly (L. Coulon, in "*Et maintenant ce ne sont plus que des villages,*" 30–32; D. Klotz, "The Theban Cult of Chonsu the Child in the Ptolemaic Period," in *Documents de Théologies Thébaines Tardives* I, 127). As Coulon demonstrated, this statuette can be linked to a high-ranking Theban family, just like Doc. 11, and thus dates to the reign of Ptolemy III or IV (L. Coulon, not the second century [so Albersmeier, 54]). Note also that the proposed translation of a female epithet, "with festively decorated breasts (*sḫb mnḏ.tj*)" (60) is incorrect; this should properly be "with festively decorated *eyelids*" (also *mnḏ.tj*; see *Wb*. II, 93, 13–14).

J. Brett McClain (69–96) offers preliminary copies and translations of Ptolemaic inscriptions from the Small Temple of Medinet Habu. Final facsimile copies and detailed commentary are currently in preparation by the Epigraphic Survey. These inscriptions are enormously important for studying Theban theology in the Graeco-Roman period, particularly regarding the serpentine form of Amun (Kematef), his successor (Irita), and the Ogdoad reportedly buried near the temple in the Mound of Djeme. Nonetheless, while some of the texts were published in the Nineteenth century by Champollion and Dümichen, and Sethe quoted excerpts in his fundamental study (*Amun und die Acht Urgötter von Hermopolis*, 1929), they have remained virtually unstudied until recently. One eagerly anticipates the final Epigraphic Survey drawings, particularly for the jamb reliefs featuring less common ram-headed forms of Amun and Osiris (91, 93).

The texts feature many difficult spellings characteristic of the Ptolemaic period, and McClain's translation contains several uncertainties. C. Zivie-Coche recently published a new translation with improved readings and extensive commentary ("L'Ogdoade à Thèbes à l'époque ptolémaïque [II]. Le périptère du petit temple de Médinet Habou," in *Documents de Théologies Thébaines Tardives* 2, 227–84), and the reviewer discussed many passages pertaining to Kematef and the Ogdoad (*Caesar in the City of Amun*, 467).

Robert K. Ritner (97–114) discusses temple constructions in Thebes from the reign of Ptolemy IX Soter, a complicated era involving coregencies, temporary exile, and the brutal quashing of a Theban revolt (for which one may also consult A. E. Véïsse, *Les "révoltes égyptiennes,"* 2004). By closely analyzing the different titularies, Ritner distinguished between the discreet portions of the reign (a phenomenon explored recently by S. Caßor-Pfeiffer, "Zur Reflexion ptolemäischer Geschichte in den ägyptischen Tempeln aus der Zeit Ptolemaios IX. Philometor II./Soter II. und Ptolemaios X. Alexander I. [116–80 v. Chr.]: Teil 1: Die Bau- und Dekorationstätigkeit," *Journal of Egyptian History* 1, 2008, 21–77). This revision allows Ritner to conclude that Ptolemy IX continued supporting temple decoration in Karnak and Medinet Habu even after the Theban rebellion which had been endorsed by the local clergy.

Claude Traunecker recently surveyed much of the same material ("Thèbes, été 115 avant J.-C.: les travaux de Ptolémée IX Sôter II et son prétendu 'Château de l'Or à Karnak'," in *Documents de Théologies Thébaines Tardives* 2, 177–226), publishing for the first time the Ptolemaic Karnak reliefs mentioned by Ritner (detailed photographs are also available at http://www.cfeetk.cnrs.fr/karnak/?iu=2196). Note that Traunecker argues against Ritner's interpretation of a royal epithet (Ritner, 105, 107, 110), providing detailed photographs which favor the traditional reading: *iwʿ mnḫ n nṯr:wy-mnḫ.w* (Traunecker, 196; note also that the horizontal ʿ3-signs in the divine epithets of Amun on 204–5 look quite different than the *mnḫ* hieroglyph).

Finally, Ian Moyer (115–45), returns to a more general theme, cultural interaction between Egyptian priests and the Ptolemaic administration, a subject he explored more broadly in his recent book (*Egypt and the Limits of Hellenism*, 2011). Moyer eschews traditional assumptions about Hellenization (or the lack thereof) during this period by introducing the concept of a "Middle Ground." This artificial space, in which Egyptians boasted fictive, honorary Greek titles and Macedonian rulers acted as traditional Pharaohs, was "created by two groups attempting to maintain mutually beneficial relations in the particular social and political conditions of Ptolemaic Egypt." Moyer illustrates this new approach by investigating the trilingual decrees (imperfect hybrids of Greek and Egyptian epigraphic traditions), and the self-presentation of Hellenized Egyptian officials of Upper Egypt, especially regarding their unabashed display of the Alexandrian wreath (*mitra*).

David Klotz
Yale University

P. Vernus, *Affairs and Scandals in Ancient Egypt*, Translated from the French by David Lorton, (Ithaca-London: Cornell University Press, 2003). ISBN 0801440785. Pp. xi+211, 46 illustrations.

Pascal Vernus's book represents not only a thoughtful and detailed study of social, political, and moral scandals occurring during the Late New Kingdom in Egypt, but also a critical interpretation of the moral transformations affecting the fading power of the late Ramesside kings and the society and culture of this period. In its foreword, Christiane Desroches Noblecourt already reveals to the reader that the target of this work is not the brilliant and harmonious Egyptian civilization, but rather the "atmosphere ... propitious for the commission of felonies by cheerful and cynical rascals far from the seat of royal power in the capital" (viii). Thus, the reader of Vernus's work embarks on a journey through the most pernicious deeds attested in the textual and archaeological evidence from the New Kingdom.

The exceptional selection of court records, memoranda, indictments and administrative documents allows the author to discuss i) legal hearings about tomb and temple robberies; ii) strikes, protests, and offenses committed by workers at Deir el-Medina; iii) the misdeeds of Paneb, a particularly incorrigible scoundrel of this community; iv) the misbehavior of Penanukis, a priest of the domain of Khnum in Elephantine; and v) the intricate plot against Ramses III. The study was first published in French in 1993 under the title *Affaires et scandales sour les Ramsès,* although its current translation into English by David Lorton is not an updated revision of the original, which in some cases deprives the reader of the most recent bibliography on the subject. Furthermore, the English title is misleading as the target of Vernus's examination is exclusively the scandals that occurred during the Ramesside period and not in the entire history of ancient Egypt.

The book consists of five chapters in which Vernus analyzes symptomatic cases of the profound moral decline observed in the New Kingdom, followed by a chapter of recapitulation in which he compares old and new values, namely, the traditional and novel concepts of justice, ethics, divine intervention, and individuality. He makes it clear that a major reason for moral deterioration was people's skepticism with regard to the effectiveness of their institutions. A foreword by the late Desroches Noblecourt (vii–viii), a preface by the author (ix–x), and a translator's note (xi) precede chapters 1 through 6. An appendix with the attested terms for bribery (151–55), a list of abbreviations (155–57) and the endnotes (159–200) complement the main section, ending with the indices for subjects (201–5), Egyptian terms (207–8), and passages translated (209–11).

The first chapter (1–49) covers the robberies of the royal tombs in western Thebes and other cases of thievery in tombs of nobles and mortuary temples. This section begins with Vernus's opinion that the particular mortuary beliefs in Egypt ultimately had an effect on the economy as "[e]normous quantities of goods and precious materials lay wasted in tombs, removed in principle from use or enjoyment by the living" (3). Thus, the deficient circulation of goods and even of persons stimulated the activities of thieves at Thebes, which Vernus tracks down mainly through the papyrological evidence dating to years 16–17 of Ramses IX and 19 of Ramses XI (i.e., year 1 of *wḥm-mswt*). Regarding their methods, Vernus comments that, for violating a

rock-cut tomb, thieves needed to carry out clearing and digging for days, finally penetrating the burial chamber and removing amulets and jewelry. In temples, they removed portable items of gold, silver, and wood, and snipped off the metal sheeting of door frames, naoi, and divine barks. The evidence shows that robbers usually organized into bands of roughly a dozen members, centered on men united by family and professional ties [cf. the unpublished work by Ben Rayner, *Tomb Robbery in the Late New Kingdom at Thebes: The Social and Political Implications*, Birmingham, MPhil thesis, 2000]. Spending the loot was not easy, as honest individuals could cancel any kind of transactions if they suspected the origin of the items. Vernus points out the existence of "brokers" (*šwtyw*), agents attached to institutions far from Thebes whose function was to negotiate in-kind exchanges of products or materials, suggesting that accepting goods stemming from the result of robberies was not considered to be an act of wrongdoing in these types of transactions: "[i]n a way, the sack of the west of Thebes permitted the recycling into daily life of assets that ideology had confiscated, so to speak, in its hieratic realizations" (49). Additionally, Vernus examines a second scandal in the Nineteenth Dynasty, the armed conflict between the King's Son of Kush, Panhesy, and the High Priest of Amun, Amenhotep. For this event, the reader might want to examine the latest literature: J. Palmer, "The High Priests of Amun at the End of the Twentieth Dynasty," *Birmingham Egyptology Journal* 2 (2014), 1–22; A. Thijs, "The Troubled Careers of Amenhotep and Panehsey: The High Priest of Amun and the Viceroy of Kush under the Last Ramessides," *SAK* 31 (2003), 289–306; and A. Morales, "The Suppression of the High Priest Amenhotep: A Suggestion to the Role of Panhesi," *GM* 181 (2001), 59–76. During the conflict, Amenhotep was removed from his office, Libyan troops conducted raids at Thebes, and looting continued in the western necropolis.

The second chapter (50–69) takes us to the reign of Ramses III and the periodic interruption of wages to pay the workers of the Institution of the Tomb, a situation that gradually led to their discontent, protests, and strikes. Beginning with year 29, the Turin Strike Papyrus refers to the workers' continuous demonstrations of discontentment with the authorities at Thebes and, ultimately, the supreme power of pharaoh. Beyond the intricate chain of events that forced the builders of royal tombs to threaten the Theban authorities, Vernus explains the procedure by which these workers went on strike. Having abandoned their administrative area (lit. "this day of passing the five redoubts of the tomb" *hrw pn sš t3 5 inbw n p3 ḫr*), they proceeded to the rear of the central administrative center in western Thebes, the temple of Medinet Habu, demanding to discuss the concessions with the highest authorities.

In the third chapter (70–86), Vernus examines the magnitude of the crimes of Paneb, a foreman of the Institution of the Tomb, living in the times of Seti II and Siptah (*ca.* 1200–1188 BCE). Based on the inventory of Paneb's misdeeds written by the scribe Amennakht (i.e., Pap. Salt 124), Vernus reports the atrocities that this foreman from Deir El-Medina perpetrated against the community, its institutions, and even pharaoh. Paneb was not only involved in the assassination of the previous foreman, Neferhotep, but also on stealing his slaves, using some *nekhet* (lit. "something, bak-shish") to buy the silence of the highest officials when he attacked some people, threatened to kill them, or when he had amorous excesses with several wives of his village. In addition to stealing objects from the tomb of Seti II and tools belonging to the workers, he commanded his gang to work on his own funerary monument, and even stole limestone from the tomb of Seti II.

Chapter four (95–107) deals with a provincial scandal that occurred in the domain of Khnum in Elephantine during the reigns of Ramses IV and V (*ca.* 1153–1143 BCE), in which Penanukis, a pure priest of the temple, committed various crimes against his colleagues in the temple, the community of Senet, and the patron god. The Turin Indictment Papyrus, which constitutes the primary source for Penanukis's scandals, articulates the denunciations made by the god's father Qakhepesh against Penanukis, namely, proof of sexual misdeeds with several women—including forcing one of them to abort a pregnancy, burning a house with two women in it (whom he later blinded), approaching the statue of the god while intoxicated, manipulating the local divine oracle, cutting off a person's ear (without permission from pharaoh!), stealing various kinds of objects from the temple, and committing sacrilege by taking with him five sacred Mnevis calves from the region of Heliopolis (hypostases of Atum-Re) and selling them later to Medjay troops in the fortress of Senmut (act. Biga). A periodic inventory made by the "White House" revealed that Penanukis had stolen property from the domain of Khnum equivalent to the total amount of barley for workman during a period of seventeen to thirty-three years.

In chapter five (108–20), Vernus covers the scandalous attack plotted by queen Teye and prince Pentaweret against Ramses III. The major source for this event is the well-known Turin Judicial Papyrus, a summary of the declarations and decisions taken in respect to the harem conspirators. Here, Vernus gives the reader a strong feel for the presence of ideological censorship in the text, in which editors made use of all kinds of omissions, periphrases, circumlocutions (e.g., "there were performed the bad deeds that he did, but that Pre

did not permit to succeed"), euphemisms, derogatory appellation, and "various devices aimed at modifying what, unadorned, was unacceptable to ideology" (117). In the judicial document, Ramses III himself reports the appointment of a commission and the outcome of its investigations, the list of conspirators found guilty, and the particular punishments applied to them. The list of conspirators include many individuals, mainly queen Teye (the instigator who wanted to bring her son Pentaweret to the throne), the chamberlain Pabekkamen, the cupbearer Mesedsure, and other members of the king's royal harem, such as the overseer and the scribe of the king's chamber of the itinerant harem, Panik and Penduau. In addition, several accomplices constituted the armed contingent of the conspiracy, mainly the chief of the archers of Kush, the overseer of the White House, a general, and some troop officials. Interestingly, a third network of persons involved in the plot consisted of a magician, an overseer of pure priests of Sakhmet, and two scribes of the House of Life, which demonstrates that conspirators also made use of sorcery against the king. According to their punishment, the papyrus divided the guilty into three groups: i) those who were considered guilty and executed "in the place of examination," the most dishonorable death; ii) those who were compelled to commit suicide in the same place; and iii) a third group who were to commit suicide "where they were," probable a lesser degree of dishonor. As Vernus notes, the summary of the guilty parties reveals a further surprise: three members of the commission appointed by Ramses III were also charged with accepting bribes from conspirators, debauchery, and fornication. Vernus concludes that "the sources at our disposal yield no irrefutable indication regarding the outcome of the conspiracy" (117).

In the sixth and last chapter (121–49), Vernus concludes his attractive analysis of "flesh and blood" characters with a revision of the major shifts in morality and ethics attested during the New Kingdom. These changes can explain some of the social differences, abuses, and protests; such acts were the symptoms and catalysts of a profound moral crisis that began by the time of Ramses II and the upheavals that marked the end of the Nineteenth Dynasty. The author enumerates some causes for these changes, such as climate change, the loss of control over Syria-Palestine, the disruption of tribute from this area, and the emergence of corruption, prevarication, and exploitation in society. As Vernus notes, the lack of confidence in the effectiveness of institutions, from the crown to the local priesthoods and administration, influenced the mentality, behavior, and delinquency in the late New Kingdom communities. Vernus brings this chapter to a close with the idea that the advent of theocracy at the end of the Twentieth Dynasty benefitted the priesthood and severely impacted the crown.

In general, Vernus offers the general audience, the specialist, and the student a myriad of known cases that have never been anchored in this manner before. The use of textual evidence and the contextualization of the particular episodes within the topography of Thebes, the West Bank, and Elephantine allows the reader to understand the local idiosyncrasies, vagaries, and caprices of individuals whose misdeeds made them eminent rogues of their times, and perceive some of the most prevalent difficulties facing local communities in the first millennium BCE. Three comments that do not detract from the value of the book have to do with the system of endnotes, which complicates the use of this work; the absence of bibliography, which could have benefitted the reader; and the illustrations in 87–94, to which the author does not refer in his discussions. All in all, Vernus does a remarkable job contextualizing various cases of misconduct and depravity, and introducing the reader, with his rigorous knowledge of the textual evidence, to some of the most exciting and suspenseful cases of everyday life and misconduct from ancient Egypt.

Antonio J. Morales
Freie Universität Berlin

Bernard Mathieu, Minitri Meeks, and Myriam Wissa, eds., *L'apport de l'Égypte à l'histoire des techniques.* BdÉ 142 (Cairo: IFAO, 2006). ISBN 2-7247-0417-7. Pp. viii + 301, map, ill.

This volume is the product of an international and interdisciplinary round table held in Cairo in September 2003, the collaborative brainchild of the editors. The publication contains eighteen essays covering diverse technologies, as well as a foreword by Mathieu and a chapter by Meeks concerning the study of ancient technology and Egyptology. The other essays cover a wide variety of technological specializations across a broad expanse of time, with an emphasis on the later periods. The essays are not restricted to technological considerations, but explore the various technologies as culturally embedded phenomena.

The essays are primarily in French, with six in English, and are organized by the name of the author, with the exception of the two just-mentioned contributions from the editors, which appear at the beginning of the volume. Each essay includes its own references and illustrations, some in color. There is no index or cumula-

tive bibliography. A list of the contributors with their institutional affiliations would have been helpful. Both the conference and the publication were supported by the IFAO.

In the Foreword, Mathieu notes that the goal of the organizers for both the conference and the resultant volume was to assemble a multidisciplinary group of scholars to facilitate discussion, bring recent advancements in the history of technology to the attention of those within the disciplines, and to develop theoretical tools and methodologies. Meeks' essay points out that the terms "history" and "technology" have multiple and complex meanings both singly and in combination and, as the essay's title indicates, tradition and innovation among Egyptologists, as well as the ancient Egyptians, are considered. He remarks on the intellectual "silos" that have traditionally separated archaeologists (the typical consumers of technology studies), philologists, and historians of ancient Egypt and argues for a new, multidisciplinary approach to the history of technology and its potential for a productive synergy between the disciplines.

The essays vary in content from those focused primarily on technical aspects of a particular subject, to textually based studies, to integrative studies including data, theoretical approaches, and models from one or more of the following disciplines: archaeology, ethnology (ethno-archaeology, ethno-technology), history, scientific analyses (especially chemical analyses), experimental archaeology, texts and philology (Egyptian and otherwise), art history, etc. These are used to examine questions relevant to materials and techniques of manufacture, as well as to the study of society and culture, trade and exchange, religion, and the transmission, submission, communication, acquisition, and learning of technological skills both by and from the ancient Egyptians. For this review, I have grouped the essays by type of material discussed.

Ceramics are the subject of four essays. The most technically detailed is the chapter by Ballet et al., covering Roman period ceramic production, including firing technology, and discussion of a possible new method of manufacture identified at Buto (Tell el-Fara'in). Gayraud discusses the appearance of glazed ceramics in Egypt during the Islamic period and the impact of Far Eastern trade on this development. Defernez and Marchand present a study of Egyptian copies of foreign container vessels in Late period and Ptolemaic Egypt. Bourriau's essay emphasizes the broader issues of the conference and the utility of technology and materials studies for understanding various aspects of ancient culture, society, religion, etc. She proposes six research questions that could be studied using Middle and New Kingdom ceramic data.

Textiles, including basketry, are the subject of another four essays. Weaving and dying in the Roman period are discussed in separate essays by Cardon and Mossakowska-Gaubert, the former with special attention to archaeological and analytic data from rigorously controlled excavations in the Eastern Desert, and the latter focused on terminology, especially Hellenistic, related to tunics and tunic production. Mathieu addresses issues of work, coexisting systems of measurement, social status, and other factors affecting the laundrymen who served the community at Deir el-Medina. Wendrich uses her ethnographic studies of basketry to address questions of knowledge acquisition and transmission of craft skills, emphasizing the importance of repeated motor activity in learning a manual (vs. intellectual) craft.

Glass and Egyptian faience are the subjects of two essays. Nicholson reports again on the glass furnace experiments at Amarna and gives his evaluation of Petrie's knowledge and background in technology and the physical sciences as a step toward understanding his (Petrie's) reconstruction of the two-phase process in glassmaking. Nenna discusses the history of glass working and glass manufacture in Egypt from the New Kingdom through Roman periods, as well as the last great burst of faience production in the Ptolemaic period and its sudden disappearance by the third century CE. She also briefly discusses the two-phase issue in glass manufacture.

Intellectual property and ritual knowledge related to boats and shipbuilding are explored by two authors. Mathieu, in the first section of the article mentioned above, uses Old Kingdom archaeological, representational and textual sources to suggest that ancient Egyptian mortuary examples of boats and boat building could be seen as "un substitut iconographique et condensé d'une formule funéraire" for funerary spells related to boats. Based primarily on a piece of diplomatic correspondence between Ramses II and Hattushili III, Pomey addresses the question of how the design of seagoing ships may have been planned; political and historical implications of Ramses' offer to share such information with this former rival are discussed.

Two articles address topics related to the production of works of art. Following the theme of transmission of technology, technological processes, and/or products, Jockey discusses the question of ancient Egypt's influence (or not) on Archaic Greek sculpture and the results and significance of chemical analyses documenting the presence of the manmade pigment known as "Egyptian blue" on works of art from Delos (Greece). Based on art-historical and chemical analyses of a painted relief in the church at Deir el-Surian, Innemée proposes that encaustic painting did not die

out in Egypt in the early first millennium, but was still practiced in the seventh century.

Other essays cover meat preservation and experimental archaeology (Ikram) and discuss evidence for the significance of land-based transportation infrastructure for communication as well as transmission of raw materials and finished goods (Shaw). Specific examples of brick masonry techniques used for public and private architecture from the site of Tebtunis (Umm el-Baragat) are presented by Hadji-Minaglou. The *chaînes opératoires* for copper and iron/steel metalwork during the Graeco-Roman period are discussed by Pichot et al.; a detailed outline of processes and a glossary of technical terms in French are included. The final essay by Wissa discusses the use of leather and parchment, especially as surfaces for writing, in Egypt and adjacent regions, with an emphasis on the later periods. Terms are defined, an ethnographic study of tanners in Old Cairo is reported, and detailed descriptions of the processes of leatherworking and the making of parchment and are given.

This is a worthwhile volume for anyone interested in Pharaonic and/or Graeco-Roman culture, society, history, or technology. Perhaps its most valuable contribution is not the specific technical information reported, but the ways in which the essays explore various aspects of the "cultural embeddedness" of the respective technologies, throwing light on economics, exchange, concepts of value, worth of work, religion and ritual, society, knowledge and skills acquisition and dissemination, political issues, etc. These are concepts that some scholars may not immediately associate with studies of technology. This volume will also be of interest to scholars of classical or eastern Mediterranean antiquity, although it may go unnoticed due to the presence of "Égypte" in the title.

Patricia Podzorski
University of Memphis